Business Advisory Committee on Friday, it was agreed that as it was not controversial, so we would pass this Bill without discussion Mr I D Swami

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI I D SWAMI) Madam, as you have rightly observed, it is only rectifying a mistake of figures-from 99 to 100 I, on behalf of Shri L K Advani, beg to move

> That the Bill to amend the Uttar Pradesh Reorganisation Act, 2000 as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration

Madam, it was only by mistake that a particular number 99 was shown in the Schedule in section 18 of the original legislation which, in fact, should have been 100 As it has come to notice, so this legal infirmity is being rectified by this amending Bill So I request, as you have observed, Madam, without any discussion this Bill be passed

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN The question is

> That the Uttar Pradesh Reorganisation (Amendment) Bill, 2003, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration

The motion was adopted

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Now, we shall take up Clause-by-Clause consideration of the Bill

Clauses 2 and 3 were added to the Bill

Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Title were added to the Bill

SHRI I D SWAMI Madam, I beg to move

> That the Bill be passed

The question was put and the motion was adopted

THE APPROPRIATION (NO. 5) BILL, 2003

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Now, we will take up the Appropriation (No 5) Bill, 2003

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI JASWANT SINGH) Madam, I beg to move

> That the Bill to authorise payment and appropriation of certain further sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of the financial year 2003-2004, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration

The question was proposed

DR MANMOHAN SINGH (Assam) Madam, the Appropriation Bill provides an opportunity for us to take stock of the developments in the economy during the current financial year, and this task has been facilitated by the Government's own Mid Year Review which has been brought out a few weeks ago There is, today, a lot of advertisement blitz about shining India We all would like our country to shine brighter and brighter, but this cannot come about unless we have a coherent strategy to deal with those constraints which, hitherto, have held us back and have prevented us from utilising or realising the immense development potential that our country, undoubtedly, has The Mid year Review notes that as a result of a favourable monsoon this year, the agricultural output will probably, increase by eight per cent, and that, with industry growing at six per cent, services growing at over seven per cent, the economy should register a growth rate of over seven per cent. It is, indeed, fortunate that this year's monsoon has been good, that the growth rate of economy has gone up But this improvement in the growth rate has to be reviewed against the background of an abysmal growth performance of the economy last year, when the growth was no more than 4 3 per cent

(MR CHAIRMAN in the Chair)

And if I look at the last five years, since this Government.has been in office, the average growth rate of the economy does not exceed 5 to 5 5 per cent We are, today, in the second year of the Tenth Five Year Plan, and if the Government's own figures are to be believed, then, the growth rate of the economy in the first two years of the Plan will also not exceed 5 5 per cent Therefore, one would have expected, from the Mid-Year Review, an assessment of our ability of achieve the eight per cent growth target, which is the target laid down in the Eighth Five Year Plan As I see it, current trend does not create sufficient confidence that the economy, in fact, is on a growth path of eight per cent

We all know that there are today a number of favourable circumstances in the economy For a long period, food and foreign exchange were dominant constraint on the development of our economy Fortunately, both these constraints are a thing of the past and yet we find that economy has got stuck to a growth path of not more than 5 5 per cent We need an in-depth analysis of why this is so The Review, unfortunately, does not enlighten us on this crucial point In fact, when I look at the underpinning of growth, investments rate and saving rate, I find that the peak rates were reached in 1995-96 Both in terms of aggregate investments and in terms of gross domestic savings, the peak was reached in 1995-96 Since then the economy has been hovering at lower rates of investment and lower rates of savings

In fact, both capital formation in the private corporate sector and capital formation in the public sector have been much lower in recent years that what it was in the mid nineties, particularly, in the year 1995-96 Therefore, one would like to know what is it that will change the situation from 5 5 per cent to 8 per cent growth rate The Ninth Plan had an average savings rate of 23 3 per cent The terminal year of the Plan had a savings rates of about 24 per cent and the Tenth Plan has a savings rate average of 26 8 per cent, the terminal year's average would be about 29 4 per cent We are nowhere in sight of reaching these savings rates If these savings rates are not realised, our ability to achieve a growth rate of 8 per cent and to finance it in a non-inflationary method would be seriously in doubt

In fact, Sir, the situation with regard to public sector savings has shown a sharp deterioration in the last five or six years In 1995-96, the public sector savings rate was about 2 per cent of the GDP In recent years, the public sector savings, both Central and States combined, have been a negative figure of 2 5 per cent of GDP, therefore, there is a deterioration of 4 5 per cent of the GDP If the Government had a strategy to deal with this negative turn in the public sector savings rate, the country's public finances would have improved greatly and the problems of fiscal deficit and revenue deficit, which bedevil us, would have been,

I think, more amenable to viable practical solutions Unfortunately, I don't find any analysis of the public sector savings, the behaviour, the current trend and the prospects, as far as the Review is concerned In the same way, I have mentioned that as far as gross domestic capital formation, that is, investment, is concerned, both in the private corporate sector and in the public sector, the rates of investment, in fact, have been much lower in recent years that what they were in the mid nineties Therefore, I would like to ask the hon Finance Minister to enlighten the House as to how, in the light of current trends of savings and investments and growth rate of the economy, does he visualise the prospect of our achieving a growth rate of 8 per cent in the Tenth Five year Plan

In fact, Sir, if I look at the growth rate during the current year, it is certainly true that agriculture is going to do better That is an act of God Fortunately, weather Gods have been favourable But even then the agriculture growth rate in the last five years shows a sharp decline The trend rate of agricultural growth in our country long-term trend, is about 3 per cent In the last five years, we have been, in fact, moving at a lower trend rate If we look at the fluctuations in the last five years, fluctuations in agricultural output have also increased very sharply. Sir, we all want that agriculture should do better But, for that, we need a lot more investment in irrigation, we need a lot more investment in agricultural research and extension, we need a lot more attention to rural electrification, we need a lot more investments in rural connectivity All these are areas which happen to be in the domain of State Governments And, the State finances being what they are, I do not have the confidence that the States are going to invest to the extent that they ought to be investing in irrigation, in rural electrification, in refrigeration and in rural connectivity If, therefore, there has to be a better future for our agriculture, the State finances have to improve much more sharply than is the case right now

With regard to industrial production, the Mid-Year Review projects a growth rate of six per cent during the current financial year The same growth rate as recorded last year Last year, of course, was a drought year But industrial growth rate of 6 percent in the current year cannot be considered satisfactory If this is all that we are aiming at, despite a

favourable monsoon, despite a sharp improvement in India's balance of payments, despite large stocks of foodgrains, then, there is something wrong with regard to the formulation of the macro-economic policy As I said earlier food and foreign exchange are no longer the dominant constraints, on our development Then, why is it that we are struck at the Industrial growth rate of no more than six per cent? Obviously, adequate investment is not taking place It is not taking place in the public sector, it is not taking place in the private sector, to the extent that it ought to be taking place And, when I look at what is happening in infrastructure, I think, the picture, in fact this year, is only marginally better than the picture last year In the figures that are given in the Survey during April-September, 02, the growth rate of infrastructure—six industries included in the infrastructure—was 6 5 per cent It has declined to no more than 4 2 per cent in April-September, 03

Sir we all want electricity sector to do much better But the generation of electricity has been dismal in the last three years In the year 2000-2001, the electricity generation in our country increased by no more than 3 9 per cent, in the year 2001-02 The growth rate declined to 3 1 per cent, and in 2002-03, it remained stagnant at 3 1 per cent And, during the current fiscal year, in the first half, the growth rate of electricity generation has been no more than 2 8 per cent How are we going to step up industrial growth rate with the electricity generation going up by less than 3 per cent per annum? The demand in our country for electricity is increasing at the rate of 7 per cent per annum, the supply is increasing at 3 per cent, meaning that the quality and the quantity of power available in the country is far too inadequate and the worst sufferers are our farmers The framers do not get regular supply The quality of power that they get is also very poor And, it is not surprising therefore that under these conditions, the farmers are not willing to pay the right price for electricity, and, therefore, the commercial loss of the State Electricity Boards continues to increase What is true of electricity is also true of coal It is true of steel It is true of crude oil In fact, the crude oil production is declining rather than increasing The only sector in infrastructure which shows a marginal increase in the current year is

refinery where there is a marginal increase from 5 6 per cent to 6.1 per cent I ask the hon Finance Minister with this dismal performance of the infrastructure sector, how is he going to ensure that industry does become the engine of growth? I know that he is projecting only a modest growth rate of 6 per cent for industry But, if India's industrial production grows no more than 6 per cent, I am certain, the economy cannot grow in the aggregate at 8 per cent We have, I think, today, an unfortunate situation in our country We have migrated, or, we have graduated to a service economy much too prematurely. The manufacturing sector in our country contributes no more than 17 per cent of our GDP, whereas in most other countries, in China, in South East Asia, the proportion of manufacturing output in GDP is as high as 35 to 40 per cent Those of us who believe that we can achieve 8 per cent growth rate without a strong industrial growth rate, I am afraid, they are mistaken in their assessment We need a much more vibrant industrial economy for India to solve its problem of unemployment, to solve its problem of poverty and under-development. Unfortunately, I don't feel that we have today in place a policy framework which will lift the animal spirits of our businessmen to plan for a much higher rate of industrial growth that we all need I would, therefore, like the hon. Finance Minister to enlighten us as to what is the strategy of the Government with regard to accelerating the rate of industrial growth

When I look at what is happening in China, I find that in China, the direct foreign investment is today a major factor in promoting industrialisation, in promoting growth of manufacturing and in promoting growth of exports By contrast, the direct foreign investment, after 12 years of stimulus, after 12 years of welcome remains a marginal player in our country, both in terms of its contribution to our domestic economy and in terms of its contribution to our export economy; I think, we have lagged behind, I would like to know from the hon Finance Minister as to what is his assessment of the role of Foreign Direct Investment in stimulating the industrial growth of our country

Sir, I would like to say a few words about the fiscal situation in the country, particularly, the fiscal situation at the Centre Before the crisis year of 1991-92, we had an unsustainable fiscal situation The revenue deficit of the Central Government in 1990-91 was as high as 3 2 per cent

of the GDP We made determined efforts, and we reduced the revenue deficit and by the year 1996-97, it went down to 2 37 per cent of the GDP Since then, the revenue deficit has increased, year after year, and today it stands much above the 1990-91 level The Parliament had passed the Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management Bill, which makes it obligatory on the Central Government to eliminate the revenue deficit by the year 2008 We would like to know from the hon Finance Minister what strategy has he in mind to achieve that objective I don't see a policy framework in place which can assure us that this Government has set in motion a process of eliminating the revenue deficit by the year 2008

When I look at the various components which contribute to the revenue deficit and subsidies, subsidies reached 1 8 per cent of the GDP in the year 1990-91 We brought it down to about 1 2 per cent in the year 1996-97 Since then, it is nearly back to the same level as it was in 1990-91

I look at the tax revenues As far as direct taxes are concerned, they have shown reasonable buoyancy But with regard to indirect taxes, we are, today, at the Centre, collecting about 3 per cent of the GDP less by way of indirect taxes than was the case in 1990-91 This is simply an unsustainable situation If India's fiscal deficit is to be dealt with, if we have simultaneously to invest in education, in health, also in infrastructure, then, it is obligatory that we must set in motion a process which will raise the tax GDP ratio to at least 14 per cent from the current 9 per cent of our GDP

I would like to know from the Finance Minister as to how he plans to raise the tax GDP ratio, which must be raised, if we have to achieve our growth objective, objectives of equity, objectives of having an infrastructure which is second to none in Asian countries

Sir, these are some of the issues which occur to me as I go through the Mid-year Review, and I hope, that the hon Finance Minister, when he replies to the debate, he will enlighten the House as to what his assessment is with regard to our ability to achieve 8 per cent growth rate What does he plan to do to stimulate the investment, both in the private sector and in the public sector? What does he plan to do to ensure that States have adequate resources to invest in agriculture,

in agricultural research and invest in rural connectivity, invest in improving the rural infrastructure?

These are some of the issues which, I hope, he would enlighten us when he replies to the debate Thank you

SHRI BALBIR K PUNJ (Uttar Pradesh) Thank you, Mr Chairman, Sir, for providing me an opportunity to speak on certain important subjects of the Mid-Term Review of the Indian Economy I heard Dr Manmohan Singh with rapt attention I have the highest regard for him, both as a Parliamentarian and as an economist But, Sir, when I was listening to him today, I realised, somewhere, after Dr Singh has joined politics, the economist in him has grown short in stature and the politician in him is growing up He spoke, Sir, more as a Congress politician and less as an economist

Sir, this debate is taking place in the wake of a very healthy development In fact, any Indian, who would have seen yesterday's newspapers, would have felt genuinely proud that the foreign exchange reserves of India have crossed the hundred billion dollar mark Now, it is a great achievement Sir, in this year alone, the foreign exchange reserves have grown up by 30 54 billion dollars as compared to the last year In fact, Sir, in the last four weeks, almost every week, there has been an addition of one billion dollar. Sir, I would like to take you back to 1991, December 1992, to be precise, that is precisely when India's foreign exchange reserve was less than a billion dollar, good enough to pay only for a fortnight's imports

We were reduced to a position that we had to pawn our gold stocks to meet our international obligations and we had to go to the World Bank and the IMF for contingency fund to meet our immediate needs From that stage, we have come to a level where we are adding one billion dollars of foreign exchange every week.

I also recall an incident The ONGC (Videsh) has an interest in oil and natural gas in Vietnam I needed to pay a mere US $ 7,000 for a commercial deal and India had to forego this deal because we could not manage those US $ 7,000 And, today, we all know that the Indian

corporate, whether in private or in public sector, can swing deals worth billions of dollars without thinking, provided deal make an economic sense So, we are in a state of good health today Our economy is giving us confidence Our foreign exchange reserves are going up Incidentally, in the last 45 months, for the first time, the stock market has crossed the barrier of 5,500-mark It is because there is a real economic activity that is taking place in the country The fundamentals of the economy are very strong If you look at the inflation rate today, it is hovering between 4-5 per cent, which is very, very manageable Look at our exports The exports are growing up, in spite of the fact that the rupee is turning. In fact, when our foreign exchange reserves go up and the rupee strengthens, it obviously is an indication that our economy is in pink of health.

Dr Singh acknowledged that the collection of our direct taxes have gone up In fact, the advance tax collections from the Indian companies are up by 40 per cent It is not a small thing Most of the experts feel that the average growth rate in all the three segments agriculture, manufacture and services—of the economy has been in the range of 8-10 per cent For the first time, we find that all the three engines of the Indian economy *i e* , manufacturing sector, tertiary sector and the farm sector, are on full throttle, full fire and the economy is surging ahead We are talking about agricultural sector If you look at the Mid Year Review, 2003, you will find that you are going to touch the production of about 220 million tonnes during the current year and earlier the highest peak was 212 million tonnes This is an increase of 8 million tonnes If the farming sector was not doing well, if the farmer could not contribute, obviously, we would not be hitting this sort of production figure in agriculture It is not only agriculture where we are doing well Look at the manufacturing sector. From the days when we used to produce only Ambassador cars, Lambretta scooters, Fiat cars, where we used to stand in queues to get these vehicles for years, or, we had to pay more price in black market, we have moved to an era and come to a situation where India has become a hub for export and manufacture of automobile parts and automobiles of world quality.

We have developed automobiles at one-tenth of the cost. We are exporting, and we are exporting to the developed countries. I quote from the Mid-Year Review. According to it, "This year, the automobile

exports stood at 2,21,331 units in April-September, 2003, up by 68 per cent, *from 1,32,030 units shipped during the same period last year*" Then, Sir, the export of passenger cars grew by 75 per cent The export of two wheelers grew by 65 per cent Along with the growth in the exports of finished automobiles, there has also been an upsurge of exports of automobile components In fact, India is becoming a source country for automobile parts to world-renowned manufacturers, the world over

Then, there has also been development in the steel sector Our steel industry, not long back, was called a sick industry Again, I quote from the Mid-Year Review It says, "The technological improvements and cost reductions obtained by steel companies through the 1990s in response to liberalisation appear to be bearing fruit In addition, while international steel prices rose sharply from January, 2002 to March 2003, domestic demand growth, assisted by development in infrastructure, such as, NDHP and the housing industry, has been buoyant Maintaining the trend, observed in two years, in the first half of 2003-04, output of finished steel rose by 7 4 per cent. And, after a 36 8 per cent increase in exports of finished steel in 2002-03, such exports, in the first half of the current fiscal year, grew by a further 39 per cent to 2.65 million tonnes " Sir, if you look at the other areas of infrastructure, say, telecommunication, there are 2 crore telephone lines There has virtually been explosion, as far as telecommunication is concerned We not only have more telephones today, but also we are making available telephones to common people, to industry at international cost It is for the first time in the living memory of Indians that they have seen telephone tariffs coming down year after year Sir, when the telephone tariffs come down that helps the Indian industry to become competitive.

Similarly, with the 'Dream project' of our Prime Minister, Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, of having express highways, linking North with South, East with West and Silchar to Porbandar, they have regularised the road scenario, the transportation sector. When you have international-class roads, you help your industry to become competitive; you connect villages and towns, you help people to get from one place to another; you help

transportation of goods and services from the production centre to consumption centre

Sir, Dr Singh was mentioning about infrastructure—telecommunications, roads, and ports The ports are being modernised Earlier, the waiting period at the ports used to run into months And, the industry had to pay, the trade had to pay, in fact, that means, the consumer had to pay a heavy cost in the shape of revenue But, now, our ports are being modernised Their capacity is being increased The waiting period has evaporated In fact, our ports, today, are the best in the region Sir, if you look at the economy as a whole during the last five years—I don't want to go into statistics for the time being—I want to emphasise on what we call 'the feel-good-factor' What is this feel-good-factor? Sir, earlier we were used to living in an economy of shortages Whenever we thought of a commodity of consumer use, it was always in short supply Take the example of LPG connections We, as Members of Parliament, know about this We had the privilege of having a coupon book and in the morning, people used to queue up outside our houses to collect these coupons, so that they could go and buy themselves a gas connection If somebody needed a second cylinder, he had to either bribe the deliveryman or he had to use a reference Such things don't happen in any civilized country It is a shame that we had to put up with that sort of a thing even after more than four decades of our Independence During the last five years, that queue has disappeared Many advertisements are coming on TV, wherein the Gas companies are saying that they are open all the 24 hours to provide refills, and new connections across the counter

Now, look at the telephone connections Earlier, you needed to be either a Member of Parliament, or, an MLA, or, a letter from some high authority, or, you had to be medically sick People thought of all sorts of cases to get a telephone connection Today, you have telephone companies coming to your houses, requesting you to take a telephone connection As I said earlier, it is not only that you have telephones available on demand, but they are available to you at internationally competitive prices Sir, if the Indian industry has become competitive, we must also realise that the cost of inputs, which the industry needs, has come down If you look at the interest rates, you will find that we have internationally competitive interest rates We are making available

capital to the industry so that it becomes competitive at the international level Sir, Dr Manmohan Singhji was talking about the tax-GDP ratio He expressed concern that the tax-GDP ratio is stuck between 9 and 10 per cent He also posed a question It was a very valid question How and when is this ratio going to go up? Sir, when we have to improve the tax-GDP ratio, we have to introduce this Value Added Tax Let me remind the House that it is basically the Congress Governments, which resisted this Even in Delhi, they resisted the implementation of such a progressive measure If you don't have VAT, it is not easy to increase the tax-GDP ratio Sir, in fact, it is time we thought in terms of de-politicising the economy When we talk of reforms here, our friends on the other side oppose them But they do the same sort of a thing in the States, which they control If we try to introduce privatisation here, there is opposition It has been alleged that the country's silver is being sold, but in all States including West Bengal, the loss-making units have been sold, the profit-making units have been sold In Punjab, they had been sold In Madhya Pradesh, when Shri Digvijay Singh was the Chief Minister, they were sold and they were privatised The country had sunk more than Rs three lakh crores in public sectors without adequate return, and we just cannot afford to go on sinking in money

1.00 P.M.

Sir, I now come to labour laws This has been one of the big stumbling blocks in bringing the reforms We have a healthy competition going on with China China has overtaken us in most of the things One of the reasons is, though there is a Communist regime, they have introduced labour reforms I remember being told by the software company people in Bangalore—they run a very successful business—that they had bagged a contract for five years

It entailed employing 25,000 people They did not set up a facility in India They decided to shift it to China The reason was that facility was needed only for five years, and, if you employ 25,000 people for five years, and, then, there is no business, what do you do with that? So, we have labour laws, today, in this country which discourage people from setting up manufacturing facilities They stop the growth of jobs They defeat the very purpose for which our friends claim to speak

Then, Sir, we have already reached what the experts call an 'Ice Age ' It is called 'Ice Age', that is, Information, communication and entertainment It is really a matter of pride for India that in the last five

years, particularly, we have achieved what was unthinkable five years back, in all the three fields, that is, information, communication and entertainment Indian movies are doing roaring business abroad As regards our communication network, as I mentioned earlier, Sir, we have more than two crore telephone connections and we have telephone facilities at the most competitive price, and information and communication go hand in hand In fact, I was talking about depoliticisation of economic matters Another example that comes to my mind is that there has been a proposal to corporatise the Port Trust which manages various ports in the country Unfortunately, that Bill has been pending for two years and it has not been possible to push through that proposal because we could not get cooperation from our friends from the other side So, if Dr Manmohan Singh is serious about pushing up, and improving the quality of infrastructure in this country, then, he has to join hands with those who seek to depoliticise the decision-making in economic matters and take hard decisions—you cannot do it by opposing one step in Delhi and doing the same thing in your own State where you are the ruling party In fact, future looks very bright There was an international report recently and it is called the BRICs I will quote from the report as to what future holds for India. Each Indian should feel proud of the conclusions in this report. It says, "Over the next 50 years, Brazil, Russia, India and China, that is, the BRICs economies, could become a much larger force in the world economy We map out GDP growth, income per capita nd currency movements in the BRICs economies until 2050 " Sir, in case of India, it further says, "While growth in the G-6, Brazil, Russia and China is expected to slow significantly over the next 50 years, India's growth rate remains above 5 per cent throughout the period India's GDP outstrips that of Japan by 2032 " I read it again, Sir, because it is very significant "India's GDP outstrips that of Japan by 2032 With the only population out of the BRICs that continues to grow throughout the next 50 years, India has the potential to raise its US dollar income per capita in 2050 to 35 times current levels " That is, by 2050, in the next 47 years, our income levels, per capita income in dollar terms, is likely to rise by 35 times Sir, before I end, I would like to request the hon Member and you, Sir, to look at page one of the yesterday's *Times of India* It was a five-column story The heading was "It is happening again 2 8 lakh new jobs " It is very significant because the jobs are in the BOP sector

At the same time, I would like to point out that while the bulk of India is growing, it is progressing ahead, those unfortunate people, that 26 per cent people, who are Below the Poverty Line, who are not being inducted into the system, have somehow been left out They are not benefiting from this growth, they are deprived, and when we think in terms of economic policies, we will also have to think about those who are not part of this new economy and left out

MR CHAIRMAN Hon Members, as decided in the morning meeting today, there will be no lunch hour today I hope the House agrees to it

SOME HON MEMBERS Okay, Sir

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU (WEST BENGAL) Thank you very much, Mr Chairman, Sir, for giving me this opportunity for the last twenty-five minutes, I have been very intently listening to the rumblings of Mr Punj He made an observation *(Interruptions)*

SHRI BALBIR K PUNJ You have also started rumbling

MR CHAIRMAN Please let him speak

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU He heard Dr Manmohan Singh and he finds that the economist *(Interruptions)*

SHRI BALBIR K PUNJ I was rumbling, he is grumbling

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU I think, he is speaking out of turn He observed that Dr Manmohan Singh's entity as an economist has gone down,—in his estimation—and the entity as a politician in Dr Manmohan Singh has gone up I am not joining issues with him on that But what I find is that increasingly pamphlet writing has become a thriving industry with this particular dispensation that we have I do not know what he has read and what he has not read I am given to understand that he is the Chief of the thinking forum of the BJP So, if that is so, I think, it is a sad commentary on the state of affairs But he has surely not read the Mid-Term Review which is being discussed here in the House Had he read the Mid-Term Review, he would have found out that there are certain sectors where the growth rate is less than last time like the manufacturing sector It has not grown The growth is sluggish here, and it is definitely less than that of the last year, I think, I need not take the time of the House by actually quoting from the documents, and that is not a problem As such that is

not a problem The problem is this whole obsession, which is making it belief that the India is shining And, if a country is shining, there will be light everywhere, and it will enlighten all sections of the economy nd all sections of the population Mr Punj, of course, indulges in selective reading So, he was quoting from the first page story of the yesterday's Times of India But, I think, he should have also focussed his attention on an article which was also published in the *Times of India,* the other day Its title was "The chronic hunger still haunts India " This is, of course, a ground level survey which was done on the basis of the National Sample Survey, 57th round

What does it say? Mr Punj thinks that today we have a surplus economy I shall quote, Sir, only a few small extracts, "Six per cent of the urban dwellers were either homeless or living in shanties In 60 per cent of the households, they lived in houses they owned and 34 per cent had rented dwellings Only 52 per cent in the villages had access to electricity as compared to 91 per cent houses in urban India "

So, 48 per cent do not have any electricity! If you look at the performance of the electricity sector, as per the mid-term review, the entire thing is a critique, a suggestion, of how the Electricity Bill, 2003 will be implemented Generation has not grown If you observe, in the entire Ninth Plan Period, if there is a major slip, it is in the electricity sector, as compared to the earlier eight Five Year Plans And the whole emphasis, this mindset, and obsession, is that India is shining, as if there are no problems

He was very elaborate with the telecom sector Now, Sir, for the last ten years that I have been in this House, I have been very carefully following as to what is happening in the telecom sector It has escaped his attention that in his documents—in the papers that he possesses, in the Supplementary Grants—the Ministry of Finance has asked for a credit for Rs 2300 crores to BSNL for meeting operational losses on rural telephony and village public telephones So, obviously, telecom requirements have no been ameliorated by this over- embracing, over-arching presence of a 'shining India'

Sir, there is politics in the economy Sir, I do not believe that economy is an entity or a process that is devoid of politics Therefore, he may be interested in depoliticising economics, but I want the economy to hve a proper politicl direction to address those questions, which will actually benefit the multitudes of our people who are living in abject poverty today

Then, what is the situation of telephony in rural areas today? Sir, on Friday, we had the Consultative Committee meeting of the Ministry of Communications and Information Technology The Minister was explaning these things, talking about increased competition and the increased number cellular phones they were providing He was talking about growth and other things Sir, some of the MPs belonging to his own party said, 'Sir, that is fine विज्ञापन की जुबान के लिए वह ठीक है, मर, लेकिन हमारे गांवों में यह स्थिति है कि जो पुराने टेलिफोन कनेक्शंस थे बीएसएनएल के फिक्स्ड लाइन के, वे तो खत्म हो गए, वे तो चल नहीं रहे और अब वे फिक्स लाइन कनेक्शन दे नहीं रहे हैं और नया जो सीडीएमए आया है, वह गांव तक नहीं पहुंच रहा है। पुंज साहब को पता होगा, गांव में अगर इन्होंने प्रियारिटी पर कनेक्शन देने के लिए लिखा होगा तो इनको पता होगा कि पिछले एक साल में उनमें से कितने ऑपरेशनलाइज हो पाए हैं क्योंकि यह फैसिलिटी नहीं है। गांव के इलाके में यह मोबाइल फोन नहीं जा रहा है। सर, अगर आप कोशिश करें तो आप देखेंगे, अगर आप मोबाइल सैट लेकर निकलें और जैसे ही आप शहर से दस, पन्द्रह या बीस किलोमीटर बाहर जाएंगे तो आपके मोबाइल फोन की स्क्रीन पर आ जाएगा नो नैटवर्क। आज स्थिति यह है और इसमें कोई दो रायें नहीं हैं कि संख्या में हम बढ़े हैं- 1.2 था हमारा टेलि-डैंसिटी आज उसमें हम 4 तक पहुंचे, लेकिन हमारा तो विस्तृत इलाका है, जो शहरों से बाहर है, वहां पर टेलिफोन की स्थिति पहले से बिगड़ी है और इसलिए बिगड़ी है क्योंकि वहां प्राइवेट कम्पनीज़ जाती नहीं हैं और जो रूरल टेलिफोन दे रहा है बीएसएनएल, उसमें 2300 करोड़ का लॉस था, जिसकी सरकार भरपाई कर रही है और इसीलिए सप्लीमेंट्री बजट में वह फिगर डाला गया है। तो असल में कोई बोल दे कि हमारे दो करोड टेलिफोन बढ़े हैं, यह वास्तविकता या हकीकत को देखने का एक नजरिया है, एक राजनीतिक नजरिया है और गाव में लोगों को टेलिफोन नहीं मिल रहा है, यह भी वास्तविकता का एक हिस्सा है और उसको देखने की जरूरत भी एक राजनीति है और हम इस राजनीति में विश्वास करते हैं।

इलेक्ट्रिसिटी में नहीं हो रहा है। उन्होंने सही बात बोली कि सवाल अल्टीमेटली यह है कि कारपोरेट रिजल्ट्स तो बहुत अच्छे हैं लेकिन Shining India और feel good factor का बेसिस क्या है? आपके शेयर का भाव आगे बढ रहा है। क्यों बढ़ रहा है, इसलिए कि फाइनेंशियल इंस्टीट्यूशंस ज्यादा पैसे का निवेश कर रहे हैं। आपने Mid-Term Appraisal में कहा है- That

there is a tremendous inflow of foreign institutional investment in this country Why it happened' Because rupees strengthened vis-a-vis dollar Therefore, if you invest here, there is a possibility of making a fast buck Therefore, they have invested money If you look at the primary sector of the stock market, you will find that as compared to the last year में जहा एक हजार करोड रुपए इकट्ठे किए गए थे, उसके बजाय इस साल दो हजार करोड़ रुपए इकट्ठे किए गए लेकिन हर रोज मुबई और नेशनल स्टॉक एक्सचेंज का मिलाकर 50 से 60 हजार करोड रुपए का टर्नओवर होता है। इसका आधार क्या है? What is the real implication for the real economy, not the virtual economy? शेयर का भाव बढ रहा है और हमको लग रहा है कि देश आगे बढ़ रहा है और इस बात को विज्ञापन में डाला है, यह भी कोई दूर का कारण होगा अगर आने वाले दिनों में कोई स्कैम निकलता है। यह जो माहौल है, इसका फायदा कोई स्कैम स्टार उठाएगा और इसमें सरकार का भी योगदान होगा। पिछला जो स्कैम हुआ है, उसमें हमने यह पाया था कि over all देश में सरकार के द्वारा और सरकार के समर्थक पुंज साहब जैसे अर्थशास्त्रियों के द्वारा जो माहौल बनाया जाता है, इसमे अल्टीमेटली स्कैम स्टार का फायदा होता है और जब शेयर मार्केट में भाव गिरता है तो नुकसान होता है उस गरीब आदमी का जिसकी जिंदगी में इस Shining India Campaign के चलते कोई रोशनी नहीं है।

सभापति महोदय, आज हमारे देश में chronic poverty बढ रही है। ये UNDP के फिगर्स हैं। हमारी ह्यूमन डेवलपमेंट रिपोर्ट में पिछले साल आया था कि हम 124 वें स्थान पर थे, अब हम 127वें स्थान पर पहुंच गए हैं। कहा इंडिया shine कर रहा है? किन लोगों को इसका फायदा मिल रहा है? शेयर मार्केट का भाव और कारपोरेट रिजल्टस, इन पर हमें चर्चा करनी होगी। अगर आप कारपोरेट रिज़ल्ट्स देखें तो जो रिज़ल्ट्स आए हैं, उनकी झलक कुछ हद तक advance tax payment मे भी दिखाई देती है। कोई investment करके, एक्सपोर्ट बढाकर, manufacturing बढाकर, अपने व्यापार का विस्तार करके यह नहीं हुआ है। सारे के सारे जो profits हो रहे हैं, वह cost cutting के चलते हो रहे हैं और cost cutting धड़ाधड हो रही है। आप देखेंगे कि यह एक euphemism हो गया है। Right sizing of the company के चलते बेरोजगारी बढ रही है और कोई dependable बेरोजगारी के फिगर्स हमारे Mid-Term Appraisal में नहीं दिए गए हैं। क्यों नहीं दिए गए? सच्चाई क्या है, यह लोगों को बताना चाहिए।

The Finance Minister talks of greater transparency But what is the actual employment generation in the country because there is no growth in investment, there is no grwoth in savings and there is no incremental growth in the foreign direct investment? Then where are the conditions of the people going? For the last three years, there was continuous downfall

in the food production in this country But still stocks went high Everybody knows it That is the biggest mystery which only Shining India Campaign can address, that food production was going down but food stocks were going up The only implication is that people were not having money to purchase or access food That is the fact Now Sir, the Mid-Term Appraisal takes credit for diluting or liquidating the food stocks that had piled up because that led to wastage, because for the last ten years food subsidy has gone up by ten times from Rs 2700 crores to about Rs 27 000 crores So, it became a concern Now, how the Government managed to liquidate the food stock? By reducing the food prices and making food accessible to the people. No There is a politics I do agree with him that there is a politics also of the Government that it will not reduce the selling price of food in the fair price shops

They will export food by giving more subsidy to exporters to liquidate their stock And, that is exactly what has happened So, Sir, we see that figures of increased exports at the cost of our people going hungry are reflected in the Mid-Term Review So, Sir, a radically different approach is needed to actually address the real issues of the economy मग, अगर आप देखें, अच्छे मानसून के चलते थोड़ा बहुत ग्रोथ होगा एग्रीकल्चर में, यह जाहिर सी बात है। लेकिन उसमें भी यह शंका की बात है। अभी जो खरीफ का सीजन आया है उसमें कुछ खास प्रगति नहीं हुई है। हम एक्सपेक्ट कर रहे हैं रबी सीजन में थोड़ा ज्यादा प्रगति होगी। लेकिन जो छलांग हम कृषि में एक्सपेक्ट कर रहे हैं वह सम्भव नहीं है क्योंकि पब्लिक इंवेस्टमेंट जो चाहिए सिंचाई के लिए, दूसरे तमाम जो साधन हैं, यह कृषि की जो सम्भावना है उसको तबदील करने के लिए, एक वास्तविक लम्बी छलांग के लिए, उस पब्लिक इन्वेस्टमेंट के लिए सरकार के पास पैसा नहीं है। वह जो फिस्कल डेफिसिट वाली बात है उसका क्या मतलब है। जिन-जिन क्षेत्रों में प्राइवेट सैक्टर नहीं आएगा, मनमोहन सिंह जी बोल रहे थे कि प्राइवेट सैक्टर आ नहीं रहा है, हमारा कहना है कि उसमें प्राइवेट सैक्टर आएगा नहीं। उसमें किसी भी जगह से ढूंढ ढांढकर हमारे जो सरकारी साधन हैं वही सार्वजनिक साधन हमको जुटाने पड़ेंगे ताकि उस इलाके में इंवेस्टमेंट हो और जिसके चलते इसका एडवांटेज हमारी इकॉनोमी में हो सके। तो कृषि में यह स्थिति है। सर, आप देखेंगे कि ज्यादातर मेन्युफेक्चरिंग सैक्टर में कोई मामूली ग्रोथ है। अगर है भी, तो काफी सारे सैक्टर हैं जहां पर पीछे छुआ है। और इस स्थिति में जहां पर एक सॉबर एक रियल एप्रेजल की जरूरत थी उसके बजाए हम पुंज साहब जैसे पम्फलेटेरियन के हाथ में इकॉनोमी को छोड देंगे तो वह देश के लिए घातक होगा। इसलिए हमारा कहना है हम तैयार हैं। अगर गौर से सरकार इस सब बात्चीत के लिए हम सबको बुलाती और मीटिंग होती और हम भी देखेंगे क्योंकि ऐसा नहीं है कि अगर अर्थव्यवस्था सुदृढ़

हो तो उसमें हमें कोई मतलब गर्व महसूस नहीं होगा, हम भी चाहते। लेकिन साथ-साथ हम यह भी चाहेंगे कि समाज के कौन तबके इसमें फायदेमंद हों, इसके बारे में हमारा भी कहना है। कुछ गिनी-चुनी कम्पनी. . (व्यवधान) हो गया सर। हमें तो जो बोलना था वह बोल दिया।

श्री सभापति: बस, ठीक है तो।

श्री नीलोत्पल बसु: सर, कुछ गिनी-चुनी कम्पनियां जिनका रिजल्ट अच्छा होगा उसको फील गुड हमारा प्रायोरिटी नहीं है। हमारा प्रायोरिटी है a real reel good so that we can address ourselves to the issue of employment, so that we can address ourselves to the issue of non-access of food, so that we can address ourselves to the issues of social sector—education and health—in the economy and all those issues which will really transform the quality of life of a billion of our population and if the Government initiates such a process, I mean, for that whatever reform whatever redirection of the economy is needed, we are prepared to engage in that dialogue But, till then, this Shining India campaign really totally distorts the requirements and the priorities of the economy With that observation, I would like to conclude

SHRI BALBIR K PUNJ Sir, Mr Nilotpal Basu has called me a 'pamphletarian' I have no problem with that provided the content is genuine and good, which I certify—whatever I said was good and genuine I think it is better to write a pamphlet than writing propaganda, making a totally one-sided propaganda speech

*SHRI R KAMARAJ (Tamil Nadu) Mr Chairman, Sir, I thank you for giving me this opportunity to speak on the Appropriation Bill on behalf of AIADMK The Mid-Term Review of our economy says that the growth of agriculture is around 8% and that of the allied sector is 7% and that the growth in GDP would register some 7% in the year 2003-2004 During the year 2002-2003, that is the first year of the Tenth Plan period, the growth of GDP dropped to 4 3 per cent due to the drought situation that prevailed in the country The country had gone through a bad phase then It is heartening to note that the growth of GDP would be 7 per cent At the same time we have to see how for it is attainable

Sir, the total expenditure of Rs 2,17,101 crore in the first-half of 2003-04 constitute nearly half the Budget estimate of Rs 4,38,795 crore In so far as the infrastructure sector is concerned, it did well in the beginning

*English translation of the original speech delivered in Tamil

but its growth decreased to just 3% in October this year. It should be noted that it was 6 7% in October last year The Public Sector Undertakings have done satisfactorily. In view of this the Centre should drop the idea of privatising the PSUs. For example, the Salem Steel Plant has been earning profit. There is no point in privatising a profit making PSU. In fact there is high-grade iron ore in and around Salem That iron ore could be mined and used to produce steel at the Salem Steel Plant The plant could be developed to generate employment opportunities. The disused runway at Salem could also be used to develop an airstrip there This will boost the industries around I request the Hon'ble Minister to look into this matter and do the needful

Mr Chairman, Sir, there is no point in saying that our economy is growing or that our godowns are overflowing We have to see whether the benefit has reached the common man Unemployment has been increasing and poverty could not be eradicated Yet we trumpet that there is 100 billion dollars of foreign exchange with us But what is the use of this? Because of the levy of excise duty and export of yarn, the textile industry is in doldrums The European Union with 15 members has evinced interest in buying Indian cloths. But we are exporting yarn now. In order to protect the textile industry, the textile workers and weavers I appeal to the Government to announce some relief to them

When we discuss the economic policies of the Centre, we have to refer to the states and safeguard their interest. The States have to face financial crisis due to their limited resources In case of Tamilnadu, the coffers were empty when our respected leader Dr Puratchithalaivi took over as the Hon'ble Chief Minister of Tamilnadu for the second time It is our Amma who set right the economy by taking remedial steps Sir, the recommendations of the 11th Finance Commission have been detrimental to the interests of States. So I request the Hon'ble Minister to see that the 12th Finance Commission undo this and give States their due The Hon'ble Chief minister of Tamilnadu has written to the Hon'ble Prime Minister to give Rs. 3,000 crore as an untied package of grant assistance to Tamilnadu to meet the requirements. I appeal to the Centre to extend this assistance without delay. The Government of Tamilnadu has demanded for increasing the States' share of divisble resources of the Centre from 29 5% to at least 33%. I appeal to the Government to increase this and help the States to meet their obligations

With these words I conclude

श्री लालू प्रसाद (बिहार): धन्यवाद सभापति महोदय, माननीय फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर जिन्होंने बिल पेश किया है, वे हाउस में नहीं हैं और जब हाउस में नहीं हैं तो हम लोगों की लिखी हुई बातों को पढ़ भी नहीं पायेंगे। कम से कम यहां मौजूद रहते तो बातों को समझते, संज्ञान लेते या क्या करते, क्या नहीं करते...

श्री सभापति: वे सब सुन रहे हैं।

श्री लालू प्रसाद: अगर सुन रहे हैं तो उनको आना चाहिए।

वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री आनन्दराव विठोबा अड़सुल): आप जो भी बोलेंगे, हम लिखते रहेंगे।

श्री सभापति: वे सुन रहे हैं।

श्री लालू प्रसाद: धन्यवाद सर, हमने अपना मत प्रस्तुत कर दिया। महोदय, आप राज्य के मुख्य मंत्री रहे हैं और मैं भी मुख्य मत्री रहा हूं। देश में प्राय: सब जगह लोग मुख्य-मंत्री हैं। जब कोई नया नया मुख्य मंत्री बनता है तो यही आरोप लगाता है कि हमको खजाना खाली मिला और एक दूसरे पर आरोप-प्रत्यारोप होते रहते हैं। इस देश में प्लानिंग कमीशन है, प्लानर्स हैं और बीच में काम करने वाले सक्षम और योग्य पदाधिकारियों को भी रखा जाता है। इस देश में एक दूसरे के राज्य को नीचा दिखाने के लिए और वहां के शासकों को नीचा दिखाने के लिए मीडिया के माध्यम से दिखाया जाता है कि अमुक राज्य फिसड्डी राज्य है - खास करके हमारे राज्य के मामले में है। हर राज्य से यहां कोई न कोई प्रतिनिधि और पार्टियों से लोग आते हैं। तमिलनाडु से आते हैं, चेन्नई से आते हैं, करूणानिधि की पार्टी से भी आते हैं। इनका जयललिता जी के ऊपर क्या आरोप होता होगा? जयललिता जी का क्या आरोप होता होगा? ऊमा जी ने क्या कह दिया - वहां के जो कांग्रेस पार्टी के मुख्य मंत्री थे - कि खजाना खाली है। रोड, बिजली पानी की समस्या है। रोड नहीं है, यह नहीं है, वह नहीं है, रोजगार नहीं है। अब तो उनके सर पर पड़ी है, पता लग जाएगा कि रोड और बिजली-पानी की समस्या का समाधान करती हैं या नहीं। महोदय, राज्य के सारे मुख्यमंत्रियों से अगर पूछा जाए तो हर मुख्य मंत्री रोकर कहेगा - कोई भी खुशी से नहीं कहेगा कि हमारे यहा सारी व्यवस्था, पैसा-कौड़ी सब कुछ है। कोई नहीं बोलेगा। सब रोते हैं। कर्मचारियों को, टीचर्स को तनख्वाह देने के लिए पैसे नहीं हैं। मेरे यहां तो बैस्ट फिसकल मैनेजमेंट का सर्टीफिकेट राबड़ी देवी को मिल गया। अगर इकॉनॉमिक्स टाइम्स को पढा गया होगा, महोदय, आपको पढ़ाया गया होगा तो उसमें आप देखेंगे कि उस राज्य को यह अवार्ड मिला है, जिस राज्य को फिसड्डी राज्य कहा जाता है, जिस राज्य के तलवार से दो टुकड़े कर दिये गए। जहां खजाना है, झारखंड बन गया, जहां

विडंबना है, वह बिहार रह गया। सच पूछा जाए तो हम बिहार को बांटना नहीं चाहते थे। हम कुछ कर भी नहीं सकते थे क्योंकि दिल्ली इतनी सशक्त है, पॉवरफुल है। पार्लियामेंट को अधिकार है कि जिस राज्य की बाउंडरी को जब चाहे बदल दे किन्तु हमने विरोध किया था। महोदय, जहां माल है, जहां पैसा है, माइन्स और खदान है - खासकर बिहार के मामले में कहा जाता है कि Bihar is rich but Biharis are poor मैं बराबर यह कहता रहा हूं कि यह हमारा अपमान है। चाहे मध्य प्रदेश के हों या जिन राज्यों में माइन्स हैं, उनका मालिक दिल्ली बन गया और जहां विडंबना है, बाढ़ है, सूखाड़ है, धरती की छाती फटी है, उसे अलग कर दिया। कर्नाटक चेन्नई का जो युद्ध है, लड़ाई है, पानी के सवाल को लेकर है और कल जो लड़ाई राज्यों के अंदर होने वाली है, वह पीने के पानी और सिंचाई के पानी के सवाल पर होने वाली है, हम उसमें घिरने वाले हैं। महोदय, ऐसा मैंने पहले भी कहा था। मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि और जानना भी चाहता हूं कि आजादी को इतना समय गुजर गया, कौन प्लानर्स थे, कौन लोग थे जिन्होंने सोचा-विचारा नहीं और गाडगिल फार्मूले का इस्तेमाल करके - अगर आप हमारे राज्य को देखेंगे तो in comparison of other States, बिहार में लोएस्ट इन्वेस्टमेंट हुआ है - in the field of infrastructure और पर-कैपिटा आमदमी के मामले में। हमारा बिहार, सामन्तों का बिहार, जमींदारों का बिहार, लुटा, पिसा-पिटा बिहार, जिसको अंग्रेजों ने लूटा, जब हम ज्वाइंट थे तब मुम्बई में मेरा पैसा लगा, कोलकाता मैट्रोपॉलिटन सिटी में मेरा पैसा लगा है। जब उड़ीसा, बिहार और बंगाल एक थे तो उन दिनों अंग्रेजों ने हमारा शोषण करके कोलकाता को सजाने का काम किया था। उन्होंने बड़ी-बड़ी मेट्रोपोलिटन सिटीज़ को सजाने का काम किया था। मैं संसद से लेकर खेत-खलिहानों तक सारी मीटिंगों में कहता रहा हूं कि बिहार के मामले में हमारे साथ भेदभाव हुआ है, चाहे जो भी सरकार रही हो, चाहे हमारी भी सरकार रही हो। हमने भी तीन-तीन प्रधानमंत्रियों को चुनने का काम किया, हमने योगदान दिया, सरकार बनाने का काम किया लेकिन बिहार के साथ इंसाफ नहीं हुआ। महोदय, बिहार के साथ नाइंसाफी हुई और लगातार बिहार के लोगों को कहा जाता है "बिहारी"। जो बिहारी मिट्टी काटने, गिट्टी ढोने के लिए कोलकाता में चाक चलाने जाते हैं, जूट मिल में जाते हैं, दो सौ साल पहले, ढाई-तीन सौ साल पहले अंग्रेजों ने हमारे बिहार के उन मज़दूरों को बोट में ले जाकर मॉरीशस के टापू में पहुंचाने का काम किया था और आज वहां मॉरीशस में बिहार के लोगों ने अपना एक देश बनाया है। सूरीनाम में या गुवाहाटी या असम हो, चारों तरफ हमारे बिहार के लोग आज से नहीं, न जाने कितने सालों से, डेढ़-दो सौ सालों से बाहर से पैसा लाकर देते हैं।

महोदय, फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर साहब यह बताएं, साफ-साफ बताएं, प्रधान मंत्री जी बताएं, देश को जवाब दें। अब क्या जवाब देंगे ये, समय तो गुज़र गया है इनका! मार्च, अप्रैल में चुनाव होगा। मार्च, अप्रैल या मई में आप चुनाव कराएंगे, जब कराएंगे तब कराएंगे लेकिन अब तो चुनाव सिर पर आ गया है खतरा सामने आ गया है, खतरा सिर पर है। महोदय, गोल-मोल बात करने से देश

का काम नहीं चलने वाला है। आपकी अगुवाई में हमने मुख्यमंत्रियों को कहा था कि ऐसी नीति बने कि जो राज्य विकसित हुआ हो, हम उन भाइयों का विरोध नहीं करते लेकिन आपकी नीति की वजह से अगर कोई राज्य पीछे छूट गया है जैसे ''सेवेन सिस्टर्स'' स्टेट, बंगाल, बिहार, उड़ीसा ईस्टर्न यू॰पी॰ या जो भी राज्य हों, उनका हिसाब-किताब हो जाना चाहिए, सारी बातों का लेखा-जोखा हो जाना चाहिए। आप ऐसी नीति बनाइए, ऐसा प्लान कीजिए कि इन राज्यों को स्पेशल केयर मिले। छलांग लगाइये जब तक आप छलांग नहीं लगाएंगे तब तक ये राज्य कैसे कंपीट करेंगे? कैसे बराबरी में आएंगे? कैसे ट्रांसपेरेंसी लागू होगी? हमारे फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर कहते हैं कि हम ट्रांसपेरेंसी चाहते हैं। महोदय, हम भेदभाव नहीं चाहते हैं लेकिन अगर आज हिसाब-किताब किया जाएगा तो देखा जाएगा। हम पीठ थपथपा रहे हैं, हमारे बी॰ जे॰ पी॰ के बलबीर पुंज जी भाषण कर रहे थे और अखबारों में भी मैं देखता हूं कि हमारी सबसे बड़ी उपलब्धि क्या हो गई कि चन्द्रशेखर जी के समय में सोना बेचकर हमने अपने डिपॉजिट को कैसे रखने का काम किया लेकिन अब एक सौ अरब डॉलर की विदेशी मुद्रा है। यह पैसा किसका है? मैं जानना चाहता हूं। सदन को यह जानने का हक है, देश की जनता को यह जानने का हक है कि आप जो पीठ थपथपा रहे हैं, आखिर यह पैसा कहां से आया? यह पैसा किनका है? विदेशियों का पैसा है या स्टॉक मार्केट में लगा हुआ पैसा है या एन॰आर॰आई॰ का पैसा है? . (व्यवधान)... आप बात सुन लीजिए, बता दीजिएगा। हम यह जानना चाहते हैं कि एन॰आर॰आई॰ का पैसा या यह पैसा जो आपने जमा किया है, या तो सोना बेचा है या कहां से यह पैसा आया? यह पैसा आपके पास है, बहुत खुशी की बात है, हम आपको बधाई देते हैं लेकिन देश को जानना चाहिए कि यह पैसा कहां लग रहा है? इस पैसे को आप कहां लगाना चाहते हैं, यह मैं जानना चाहता हूं। जिन राज्यों के ऊपर कर्जे का बोझ है, केंद्र सरकार या वर्ल्ड बैंक का कर्ज़ा, यह जो कर्ज़ा है, यह भारत सरकार से राज्यों को मिलता है। विकास के कामों के लिए और उस पर हमें 11 प्रतिशत या 10 प्रतिशत इंटरेस्ट देना पड़ता है। क्या आपने सोचा है कि एक सौ अरब डॉलर में देश को बेहतर बनाने के लिए जो आप कह रहे हैं कि हमारे पास इतने रुपए का रिजर्व है, भंडारण है तो यह भंडारण किस काम के लिए है? क्या आप कर्ज़े की माफी करना चाहते हैं? सिर्फ बिहार का नहीं हर राज्य में। हर राज्य में हर पार्टी की सरकार है, उनके कर्ज़ों को आप माफ कीजिए, मूल धन को आप छोड़ दीजिए। महोदय, मुझे बताया गया है और मैं जानना चाहता हूं फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर साहब से कि आप इस बात को बताएं कि एक सौ अरब डॉलर पर चार प्रतिशत जो सूद लग रहा है, यह पैसा किसका पैसा है?

यह किसकी जेब से पैसा आ रहा है। क्या हम किन्हीं खास लोगों का पैसा जमा करके-इस देश के गरीबों का, किसानों का और जो हमारी भारत सरकार की निधि है उसमें जो मेहनत और परिश्रम का पैसा है-उसमें सूद कमाने के लिए तो पैसा जमा नहीं किया है। महोदय, भारत सरकार एकदम कहती है कि हमने अमुक राज्य के लिए मदद की। आपने इन्टरेस्ट फ्री नहीं किया है। हमारे राज्य के

बारे में आपको मालूम होगा। मुझे अफसोस है। माननीय प्रधानमंत्री जी ने मुझे चार-पाच दिन पहले फोन किया था कि लालू आप कहां हो? हमने कहा कि हम पटना में हैं। उन्होंने कहा कि हम बिहार के लिए एक पैकेज की घोषणा करने जा रहे हैं। हमने कहा कि सर, आप हमें बता देते तो हम आपको बधाई देते, धन्यवाद देते और हम आपकी गर्दन में माला डालते। महोदय, जिस समय बिहार का बंटवारा हो रहा था, आप बिहार का लेखा-जोखा देखें, जिनको बिहार की मिट्टी और गिट्टी के बारे में मालूम नहीं है, शत्रुघ्न सिन्हा जी को मालूम नहीं है, हेमा मालिनी जी को मालूम नहीं है। यहां बैठे हुए लोगों को मालूम नहीं है। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूं कि जिस तरह से हमारे ऊपर आरोप लगते हैं, हमारा इन्वेस्टमेंट झारखंड के इलाके में था। आजादी के इतने वर्ष गुजर गए लेकिन इन्फ्रास्ट्रक्चर में एक भी बिजली के क्षेत्र में इन्वेस्टमेंट नहीं हुआ था। इन्होंने अब शुरू किया है। यह इसलिए शुरू किया है कि उधर से बिजली लाकर हम दिल्ली पहुंचाए। ये पीठ थपथपाते हैं। अभी बसु जी ने ठीक कहा है कि जब हम रात में हवाई जहाज से गुजरते हैं तो मुम्बई से चलने के बाद ऐसा लगता है कि बहुत दूर तक हम किसी काले समुद्र में तैर रहे हैं। नीचे देखते हैं तो कहीं भी बिजली नहीं। फिर बहुत देर के बाद कोई जगमगाता हुआ शहर दिखाई देता है। पायलट से पूछा गया कि यह कौन सा शहर है तो उसने बताया कि यह जयपुर शहर है। जयपुर शहर के बाद फिर समुद्र आता है। फिर आगे हवाई जहाज से आ जाइए तो हम लोगों को यह पूरा का पूरा खचमच-खचमच सा लगता है। इससे हमें लगता है कि हम लोग दिल्ली पहुंच गए हैं। यह है इनकी उपलब्धि। यह देश के चंद लोगों की सुविधा के लिए है। देश में कोयला लेने के लिए आपने झारखंड बनाया। झारखंड से कोयला ढोने के लिए आपने चार लाइनें बिछाई हैं। आपने सारा माल ढोने में पैसा लगाया है। आज किसान बिजली के अभाव में आत्महत्या कर रहा है। हैदराबाद में हमने देखा है और अखबार में भी हमने इस बारे में पढ़ा है। चारों तरफ ऐसा हो रहा है। कहीं पर एक प्रश्न का जवाब भी आया था कि आज के दिन तक 186 किसानों ने आत्महत्या की हैं। यह देश किसानों का है। भारत खेत, खलिहानों और मेड़ों पर बसता है। यह चांदनी चौक और नई दिल्ली में नहीं बसता, मुम्बई में नहीं बसता। अगर हमने किसानों और गरीबों की माली हालत पर ध्यान नहीं दिया तो हमारी पूरी अर्थव्यवस्था चरमराने वाली है। हमारे देश में बम्पर गेहूं हुआ, बम्पर धान हुआ लेकिन उसकी पूरी कीमत किसानों को नहीं मिली। आप कितने आदमियों को नौकरी देंगे? प्रधानमंत्री जी ने वायदा किया था कि हम हर साल एक करोड़ लोगों को रोजगार देंगे। जब इसी सदन में यह पूछा गया कि आपने कितने लोगों को काम दिया तो शून्य बराबर शून्य। बिहार में हमारा जितना पैसा डिपाजिट है, यहां पर माननीय मनमोहन सिंह जी नहीं है, प्रणब बाबू को मालूम है कि बिहार में हमारा जितना पैसा जमा है अगर आप सीडी रेश्यो को देखें तो पता चलेगा कि मेरा पैसा जा रहा है मुम्बई में, आईडीबीआई में और रिजर्व बैंक में। हमारे बिहार का पैसा जो कि गरीबों की मेहनत और पसीने का है। हमारे बिहार का मजदूर, बिहार का किसान और बिहार का इंजीनियर बाहर की कंट्रीज व गल्फ कंट्री से लाता है। जो हमारे पैसे की बचत है, वह खर्च नहीं हो रही है। बार-बार

बैंकों के नकारात्मक रवैये की वजह से हम लोगों ने आवाज उठाई है। भारत सरकार फेल हो रही है, फाइनेंस मिनिस्ट्री फेल हो रही है। हमारे रेल मंत्री श्री नीतीश कुमार जी की लापरवाही की वजह से, उनकी गलती की वजह से फोर्थ ग्रेड के रेलवे इम्पलाइमेंट के लिए जब इन्होंने मुम्बई में सेन्टर रख दिया तो शिव सेना के लोग, बाल ठाकरे के लोग लाठी से पीटते हैं। हमारे यहां के गरीब बच्चे वहां पर गए, गरीब आदमी आसाम में गए तो वहा पर भी उसकी पिटाई की गई। महोदय, हमारा यह देश टूट रहा है। मैंने यहां पर सवाल उठाया है कि देश का पैसा-मुम्बई अपने आप नहीं बना है, वह तो ट्रेड का सैन्टर है इसलिए हमारा हिसाब हम में बाटो। रिजर्व बैंक वहां से हटाओ, आईडीबीआई वहां से हटाओ और जो इडस्ट्री में हमारा हिस्सा है वह भी वहां से हटाओ। आप सिनेमा दिखाते हैं तो सिनेमा महाराष्ट्र में दिखाओ। हमें फिर दूसरी जगह नहीं जाने देना। यह देश टूट रहा है सरकार की गलत नीतियों की वजह से। सरकार की गलतियों की वजह से। आपने, प्लानिंग कमीशन में वादा किया था। यह जो एम्प्लोएमेंट का दफ्तर है, इसमें देश के पाच करोड युवक-युवतियां पाइपलाइन में बैठे हुए हैं। फोर्थ ग्रेड की नौकरी के लिए इजीनियर लडका (व्यवधान)

श्री सभापति: पाइपलाइन में कहा बैठा हुआ है?

श्री लालू प्रसाद: महोदय, पाइपलाइन का मतलब क्यू मे लगा है। पाइपलाइन का मतलब क्यू, नौकरी के लिए मौका मिलेगा। यह सरकार इसमें फेल हुई है। महोदय, मैं पूरे सत्र में लगभग एब्सेन्ट रहा हूं इसलिए सब मिलाकर कम से कम पाच मिनट और दे दीजिए।

श्री सभापति: अच्छा बोलिए।

श्री लालू प्रसाद: महोदय, इस देश को हालत बद से बदतर है। मैं फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर साहब से जानना चाहता हू कि राज्यों के ऊपर जो कर्जे का सूद है, क्या उसे माफ करेंगे? आज जो विदेशी मुद्रा के भडारण का डका पीट रहे हैं, क्या आप किसानों के लिए पानी, रोड और बिजली के इन्फ्रास्ट्रक्चर में खर्चा करेंगे? सदन को यह जानना चाहिए। यहा खानापूर्ति नहीं होनी चाहिए, बिहार में पचायतों के चुनाव को लेकर। महोदय हमारा जो बाकी पैसा था, इसी सदन में वादा किया गया था कि हम पैसा देंगे, नुकसान नहीं होने देंगे लेकिन प्रधानमत्री जी ने हम लोगों के साथ इंसाफ नहीं किया।। लाख, 87 करोड का सर्वसम्मत प्रस्ताव, बिहार के लिए पैकेज की माग सभी दल के लोगों ने भेजी थी। प्रधानमत्री जी ने फोन किया। लेकिन देखा तो, "खोदा पहाड़, निकली चुहिया"। पहाड को खोदा तो चुहिया का बच्चा निकला। यह कौन-सा पैसा दिला दिया? जो फोर लेन रोड बन रहा है, चतुर्भुज, स्वर्ण, उस चतुर्भज के विषय में मैं चार्ज करता हू कि यह जो रोड महकमा है, यह लाचारी है। मैं चार्ज करता हू। बिहार का टेलेन्टिड इजीनियर, सत्येन्द्र दुबे, इस रोड में जो सडके बन रही हैं, मार्ग चिट्ठियां हैं, हम डिबेट चाहते हैं, देश को जानने का हक है, शेरशाह सूरी ने जी॰ टी॰ रोड बनवाया था, यह जो चतुर्भुज, गोल्डन रोड बन रहा है, उसने भ्रष्टाचार को उजागर किया। प्रधानमत्री जी

को चिट्ठी लिखी कि इसमें पब्लिक मनी की लूट मची हुई है। कंसल्टेन्ट, इंडियन कंसल्टेन्ट, कंट्रक्टर किस तरह से एस्टिमेट बनाने में, किस तरह से फंडिंग करने में लूट रहे हैं। उसने लिखा कि हमारी सीक्रेसी को आउट नहीं किया जाए। दस्तखत नहीं किए, बायोडाटा लगा दिया। पी॰ एम॰ ओ॰ से चिट्ठी गई। चिट्ठी गई, आखिरी पैसा दो। तो पैसा दिया जाएगा–पैसा लुटवाने के लिए, इलेक्शन में फंड जुटाने के लिए? सत्येन्द्र दुबे ने लिखा, मैं जिम्मेदारी के साथ बोल रहा हूं। सत्येन्द्र दुबे ने पी॰ एम॰ ओ॰ को चिट्ठी जब लिखी, मैं यह नहीं कहता कि अटल जी ने ऐसा किया होगा लेकिन पी॰ एम॰ ओ॰ से सत्येन्द्र दुबे के पास चिट्ठी गई कि क्या तुमने चिट्ठी लिखी? उसने कन्फर्म किया कि मैंने चिट्ठी लिखी। दस्तखत इसलिए नहीं किए क्योंकि मेरी आइडेंटिटी मालूम हो जाएगी, लोक मेरी हत्या कर देंगे, मार देंगे। उस लडके को चेतावनी दी गई, वार्न किया गया, इनका जो निगरानी का दफ्तर है, यहां से कि आगे से तुम चिट्ठी मत लिखना, हिम्मत मत करना। चेयरमैन को लिखा। चारों तरफ लिखा कि कोंसापिरेसी के तहत हमारी बदली हुई। लॉ एण्ड ऑर्डर स्वय उसको पकडकर ले गया, चाय के बहाने ले गया। महोदय, मुम्बई तक जाने वाली, लाहौर तक जाने वाली इन सड़कों में देश का पैमा लगा है, गरीब का पैसा लगा है। एक इजीनियर भ्रष्टाचार को उजागर करता है तो कहा जाता है कि बिहार में पुअर लॉ एण्ड ऑर्डर है। बाहर भ्रष्टाचार और पुअर बात। इंजीनियर को अगुआ किया गया झारखंड में जहां बीजेपी का राज है। डम्फर जलाया गया। उस बात को लिख दिया। बिहार में इंजीनियर अगुआ हो गया। डम्फर जलाया गया। महोदय, अखबारों में सारी बातें हैं। हम लोगों ने सारी बातें सी॰बी॰आई॰ को लिख दी हैं क्योंकि ''दूध का दूध और पानी का पानी'' होना चाहिए। यह फैसला होना चाहिए। सब राज्यों की वित्तीय स्थिति बद से बदतर है। सब मुख्यमत्री रो रहे हैं, चारों तरफ मुख्यमंत्री रो रहे हैं। हम जानने वाले लोग हैं। इन लोगों ने देश का सत्यानाश किया है। देश का इतना पैसा खर्च हो रहा है लेकिन यह बेरोजगारी पर नहीं हो रहा है, भ्रष्टाचार रोकने के लिए नहीं हो रहा है। महोदय, आप जानते हैं जूदेव के मामले में जूदेव ने कहा कि हमने पैसा मांगा तो क्या हुआ? गांधी जी ने भी पैसा मांगा था, चन्द्रशेखर आजाद ने भी पैसा मागा था। महोदय, इस देश में क्या हो रहा है?

श्री सभापति: ठीक है।

श्री लालू प्रसाद: फायर्नेस मिनिस्टर साहब, जिन राज्यों के ऊपर आप का कर्जा है, आप उस का सूद माफ कीजिए। आप वहां इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर पर खर्चा करिए। आप ने हिल स्टेट्स को, 7 नॉर्थ ईस्टर्न सिस्टर्स के लिए सेल्स टैक्स व एक्साइज ड्यूटी माफ किया है, फिर बिहार के लिए क्यों नहीं? महोदय, हमारा प्रधानमंत्री जी पर और भारत सरकार के ऊपर चार्ज है। हम लोगों ने कहा था कि आप नेपाल गवर्नमेंट से बात कीजिए और फ्लड कट्रोल कीजिए तभी उत्तर बिहार आगे बढ़ेगा। महोदय, बिहार कोई भीख नहीं मांगता, लेकिन वहा वह काम नहीं हुआ। बिहार स्पेशल कैटेगरी की सारी शर्तों को पूरा करता है, लेकिन यहां ध्यान नहीं दिया जाता। बिहार की सरकार को टार्गेट किया गया है कि उसे डिएस्टैब्लाइज करो, उसे क्रिपल करो और उस की कोई मदद मत करो। महोदय, दो

टांग का चूहा गेहूं खा रहा है, लेकिन वह इंसान को खाने को नहीं मिल रहा है। आप कालाहांडी की हालत देखिए। राजस्थान की हमारी बहिनें सिर पर घड़ा रखकर 5-5 किलोमीटर तक पानी के लिए भटकती हैं। क्या वे इस देश की बेटियां नहीं हैं? हमारी बेटियां इस तरह भटकें, क्या यही इस सरकार की उपलब्धि है? जसवन्त बाबू, आप ने इसी हाउस में कहा था कि हम ट्रांसपैरेंसी चाहते हैं, हम भेदभाव नहीं करना चाहते। हम बिहार के मामले को देखेंगे, लेकिन बिहार को पैकेज के नाम पर अंगूठा दिखाया गया है और जो हमारा नॉर्मल ड्यू है, वह नहीं मिल रहा है। इन विकास योजनाओं का पैसा हमारा है। प्लानिंग कमीशन से बात हुई है, हम ही खर्च करें। आप चाहें तो सेंट्रल एजेंसी से कराइए, यह हमारा एग्रीमेंट था और सारी बातें हुई थीं। लेकिन बिहार के साथ भेदभाव और सौतेलापन बरता जाता है।

श्री सभापति: बस, अब समाप्त कीजिए।

श्री लालू प्रसाद: मैं चाहता हूं कि राज्य, राज्य में लड़ाई न हो। आज देश टूट रहा है। आप ने रिलीजन के नाम पर इसे तोड़ने की कोशिश की है। महोदय, आज युवक, युवतियों को जॉब मिलने जरूरी हैं। इसलिए जॉब्स के विषय में आप सभी पार्टियों की बैठक बुलाइए क्योंकि राइट टू वर्क यानी काम का अधिकार देश के हर युवक, युवती को संविधान में संशोधन कर के तय करिए। नहीं तो, वह युवक नक्सली बनेगा, डाकू बनेगा, बदमाश बनेगा, किडनैपर बनेगा। फिर चाहे आप जितनी भी संसद की रक्षा कीजिए, आप उसे किले में परिणत कर लीजिए और फिर देखिए आप को न जाने कितने किले बनाने पड़ेंगे। Sir, there is a serious alarming situation of unemployment in the country इस बारे में आप को सोचना पड़ेगा। हम सब लोग आप को सहयोग करने को तैयार हैं। हम ने आप से आई॰आई॰टी॰ की मांग की। महोदय, मुरली मनोहर जोशी जी नहीं हैं, उन्होंने कहा कि पैसा नहीं है। हम ने कहा इंजीनियरिंग दे दो, वह भी नहीं हुआ। हम ने कहा कि पटना यूनिवर्सिटी को सेंट्रल यूनिवर्सिटी बनाइए, बोलते हैं पैसा नहीं है। दूसरी तरफ आप कहते हैं कि हमारे पास सौ अरब डॉलर है, हमारे पास टेलिफोन है, मोबाइल टेलिफोन है, बिना पूंछवाला फोन है। यही इन की उपलब्धि है। आप आई॰टी॰ की बात करते हैं। आई॰टी॰ पीने के पानी की समस्या का समाधान नहीं करता। आई॰टी॰ ने बेईमानी की, कम्प्यूटर ने बेईमानी की। अमेरिका के राष्ट्रपति के चुनाव आई॰टी॰/कम्प्यूटर की बेईमानी से परेशानी हुई, लेकिन हमारे हाथ ने काम किया। सर, मैं मंत्री महोदय को बताना चाहता हूं कि देश की समस्या क्या है? हमारे देश की 1 अरब 5 करोड़ की जनसंख्या है, हमारे यहां 1 अरब, 5 करोड़ की मैन-पावर है, इस का इस्तेमाल आप कैसे करेंगे? उस के लिए आप ने क्या एलोकेशन किया है? अगर आप हमारे देश की इस समस्या पर ध्यान नहीं देंगे तो देश अनार्की में चला जाएगा। आप का राम, अयोध्या का नारा ज्यादा दिनों तक काम आने वाला नहीं है।

श्री सभापति: ठीक है, हो गया।

श्री लालू प्रसाद: इस तरह के सेंटीमेंट्स को लेकर, शिव सेना का नाम लेकर ज्यादा दिनों तक सड़कों पर उछल-कूद करने से देश आप को माफ करने वाला नहीं है। इसलिए इन चीजों के बारे में आप सोचें, विचारें। जो किसान है, मजदूर है, नौजवान है, इनके लिए आप व्यापक प्रबंध करिए। आप हमारे देश के किसानों की माली हालत देखिए। जब तक लोगों की आमदनी नहीं रहेगी, उनकी जेब गर्म नहीं रहेगी तब तक जंग लगा रहेगा आपके सारे सामानों में, आपकी सारी इंडस्ट्रीज में, आपके सारे इन्वेस्टमेंट में। आदमी जाएगा, निहारेगा और चला आएगा। वह वीडियोकोन को देखेगा, लेकिन जेब में पैसा नहीं रहेगा तो क्या करेगा? वह भी ठप्प हो जाएगा, बंद हो जाएगा। इस तरह सारी चीज खत्म हो जाएगी और आपको माफ नहीं किया जाएगा।

श्री सभापति: अब आप समाप्त करें।

श्री लालू प्रसाद: हम लोग आ रहे हैं, घबराइए मत। आप समझते हैं कि तीन स्टेट में जीत गए हैं, लेकिन देश की जनता अब आपको सरकार से उखाड़कर फेंक देगी। आपको अब चुनाव कराना है मार्च में, अप्रैल में करा लीजिए।

श्री सभापति: बहुत बहुत धन्यवाद, लालू जी।

श्री लालू प्रसाद: अभी समय है, ईमानदारी से तीन-चार महीने काम करके दिखाइए। यह जो आपको काम करना था, जो पहला काम वोट का है, उसमें आप फेल हुए हैं।

सभापति जी, आपकी तरफ से समय की बार-बार चेतावनी आने के बाद भी हम समय का अतिक्रमण करते चले जा रहे हैं। इतना कहते हुए हम अब बैठ रहे हैं। बहुत बहुत धन्यवाद।

श्री बालकवि बैरागी (मध्य प्रदेश): सभापति जी, अब एक प्रसंग अच्छा है शुभकामना हमको देनी चाहिए। लालू जी पटना से डी॰ लिट की उपाधि लेकर लौटे हैं और आप राजस्थान से डी॰ लिट की उपाधि लेकर लौटे हैं। आपको ये उपाधियां मिली हैं, इसलिए हम आप दोनों को बधाई देते हैं, इनको भी और आपको भी।

श्री सभापति: बहुत बहुत धन्यवाद। मैं लालू जी को धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूं कि कौंसिल आफ स्टेट्स में पहली बार स्टेट से संबंधित किसी ने चर्चा उठाई है।

श्री लालू प्रसाद: हमने सब स्टेट का कहा, भेदभाव नहीं किया, सर।

श्री सभापति: ठीक है, आप बैठिए।

200 PM

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (WEST BENGAL) Mr Chairman, Sir, at the very outset, I would like to express my gratitude to you for giving me this opportunity to participate in the Appropriation Bill, which the House is considering First of all, I would like to congratulate the Leader of the House and the Finance Minister for our foreign exchange reserves reaching a record 100 billion US dollar mark which is not only an all-time record, but, as per the newspaper reports, India has also come within the group of a very few countries which are having this substantial level of foreign exchange reserves Surely, the country feels confident and the Finance Minister deserves congratulations

Sir, this House will recall that similarly on a cold winter day, 13 years ago, in 1991, the country had to face a situation when a part of the gold reserves had to be pledged to the Bank of England just to borrow a few hundred million dollars in order to meet the requirements of our essential imports Immediately, after the General Elections, Dr Manmohan Singh had to take the responsibility of steering the finance of this country As one newspaper commented yesterday, the deft handling of the situation by Dr Manmohan Singh created the atmosphere which has been taken to the logical conclusion by the subsequent Finance Ministers, where we have been able to reach this level of foreign exchange reserves The fact is that we have been able to meet a substantial part of our foreign borrowings by premature repayments, if I understand correctly, to the extent of almost 7 billion US dollars I do hope that in course of time the Finance Ministry will come out in collaboration with the Reserve Bank of India to utilise these reserves effectively for providing the growth momentum

Sir, on a number of occasions when we have the privilege of debating and discussing the financial matters in this House, we find that whenever there is a little bit improvement of the situation by some yardstick, we are fascinated with the phrase, "feel-good-situation" It creates some sort of complacency where we do not take corrective measures necessary

Yesterday, when we were having a discussion on the sad plight of tea plantation, not only tea plantation but also coffee plantation, the hon Commerce Minister pointed out that the situation has st rted

improving a little bit in the international market and tea prices have started firming up, then, he was rightly cautioned that that should not lead us to a sense of complacency and that the corrective measures which are called for should be taken. Similarly, the very comfortable position in the foreign exchange reserves should not lead us to complacency We must tackle the problems and certain corrective steps should be taken. I am not very fond of the nomenclature—second generation or third generation reforms, and I don't go by that type of a nomenclature, but certain corrective measures which are called for ought to be taken so that we can maintain our developmental tempo on a sustainable basis

There is no dispute of the fact that everybody wants 8 per cent GDP growth rate and it is essential to create more jobs so that we can reach the target which the Prime Minister himself talks of — one crore jobs per year to reach near-full employment scenario at the end of ten years But mere slogan or mere expression of intent is not adequate It should be backed up by massive investment in the productive sectors In that context, Mr. Chairman, Sir, when I come to the Appropriation Bill, which this House is considering, I find that the Finance Minister has proposed rupees 7,660 crores and 21 lakhs should be issued from the Consolidated Fund of India to meet certain expenses

If we look at the details in the Schedule, we find that most of these amounts which we are withdrawing from the Consolidated Fund of India are, substantially, on the revenue account and not on the capital account That means, this withdrawal is aimed at meeting our normal expenditure It is not going to meet the developmental expenditure or for creating the developmental assets. Of course, it will add, to some extent, to the overall revenue deficit and fiscal deficit unless it is being squared up by having substantial revenue realisations. The figure available in the Mid-Term Economic Review shows that there has not been any substantial buoyancy in the revenue realisation, though there has been an improvement as compared to the comparable period of the previous fiscal years But, there has not been any substantial improvement wherein substantial quantum of tax comes from the Central excise There, the revenue trend in the first six months is not quite encouraging. Therefore, when rupees 7,660 crores and 21 lakhs additional expenditure are being borne, it will have its overall revenue deficit and fiscal deficit

If we want to have 8 per cent growth, even taking the risk of repeating the points, I would like to say a few things Since the hon. Finance Minister has indicated that we are not going to have extra time for discussing the Mid-Term Economic Review and the overall developmental strategy, I am taking advantage of discussing the Appropriation Bill. We must ensure, and I feel, that we encourage the domestic savings rate to reach the higher level I am not talking of the high-level which the Planning Commission has prescribed If we want to have that level of domestic savings, perhaps, the fiscal policy should be directed to encourage the rate of domestic savings. Despite our desires, the savings in the public sector would not come to the expected rate, which was projected in the Plan document The rate of savings which is expected to come from the corporate sector will be, more or less, at the same level

Therefore, the area which remains is the rate of domestic savings and that too you shall have to ensure that this rate of domestic savings don't remain marginal, a substantial part of it is made available for the investment so that the development outlay in the Tenth Five-Year Plan can match the target which has already been fixed.

If I just simply assume that incremental capital output ratio would remain at four, then the total investible resource required to achieve 8 per cent growth would be around 32 per cent of the GDP It is good that there has been, instead of current account deficit, there has been current account surplus, which is quite an encouraging trend Our performance on the foreign sector has been substantial But we shall have to keep in view that a mere 30-40 per cent—the exact figure, I don't remember—which is coming through the route of Financial Institutional Investment, FII. This is not, substantially, coming from export earnings, which was needed Because, if we could achieve in terms of US dollars, our growth in export is around 20-22 per cent on a sustainable level of almost 3-4 years in the yearly 90's, that process should be reversed with the annual growth rate of 20-22 per cent in US dollar term, of our export growth

I would like to have both As we have foreign exchange reserves, we can substantially use it for importing capital goods, intermediaries, plant and mechinery to upgrade technology, to meet the requirements of the industry, to have a sustainable growth of 10 per cent of GDP

This 'feel-good' atmosphere is quite encouraging on the basis of one-year performance and that too in the context of the overall performance of the previous year. But, it will not help us to achieve the sustainable growth of 8 per cent GDP, which is the target of the Prime Minister and which is the target of the Tenth Five-Year Plan. If we want to actually achieve it, we will get an opportunity when the Budget will be presented, because, the first year of the Tenth Plan, we didn't find the resources available for the development In the Budgetary support, it was available, but in terms of IEBR, Internal and External Budgetary Resources, which was expected to come from the public sector enterprises were much less Here also, while allocating the Plan resources, I think, the Planning Commission and the Finance Ministry should realise that instead of merely projected figures at the beginning of the year to have a higher Plan size, to create an atmosphere of 'feel-good-situation', we must be realistic in assuming what would be the quantum of IEBR I am not quoting figures but if we go year-by-year, for the last six-seven years, during the entire Ninth Plan period, and even in the first year of the Tenth Five-Year Plan period, we find that these were over-projected and, ultimately, we could not reach it, despite the Finance Minister stretching his resources to States and Central Ministries to maintain his commitment, so far as the Budgetary support to the total Plan outlay is concerned; but neither the State Governments nor the Central public sector enterprises could generate the level of resources which they committed at the time of formulating the annual Plan, and we could not, ultimately reach to the level at the end of the year Therefore, these modalities should also be thought of seriously

The third point on which I would like to make my observation is on the States The major speech has been done by Dr. Manmohan Singh, and I would not like to add to those details. No doubt, the Finance Minister has provided, in this batch of supplementary demands, some details about the transfer to the States and UTs; it will help them; but, here too, I find that classification-wise, these are on the revenue account and not much on the capital account.

I think, under the capital account, a substantial amount has been provided only under the Head 98 for the Department of Urban Development Here I have a small submission for the consideration of the Finance

Minister The type of make-believe world in which we are trying to live that we will be able to control the effective interest rate, merely by adjusting the borrowing rates, I am afraid, is simply not possible We have the expertise of the former Governor of the Reserve Bank of India, and also an economic administrator, who had a very long and very credible innings He can throw some light on this aspect of the issue Unless we are able to effectively reduce the revenue deficit and have control over the inflation, which is done-but I do not know what would be impact of the foreign exchange reserve of one hundred billion US dollars, unless it is effectively utilized, at least, a substantial part of it is being effectively utilized for productive assets - it will add to the inflationary pressure of the system Till now, the Reserve Bank is maintaing by having strict control over the money supply But, it has to be seen to what extent it would possible Unless we have control on both, the revenue deficit and also on inflation, it would not be possible to have the real reduction in the effective interest rate, which will help the industry to be competitive, which will help for export sector to be competitive That is the commitment, which the Government had undertaken on itself through the Fiscal Responsibility Bill And, that is the rationality, where at the interval of every quarter, the Finance Minister is helping us with all the data at different levels But, frankly speaking, Mr Chairman, Sir, I am little scared of that And, I know the third batch of Supplementary Demand is waiting, which will be coming at the time of presentation of the Budget We passed one in the Monsoon Session We also passed one in this session also, we are approving a substantial amount to the extent of Rs 7,660 crores and 21 lakh A substantial part of it is going to the revenue account This is, probably, giving some sort of earning And, I do hope the hon Finance Minister will take note of it

The last point, on which I would like to make my observations, is about States Now, only 3-4 months have been left for the State Government to effectively implement the Plan What is their state? As you have introduced the system of bypassing the Fiscal Responsibility Act, taking the Parliament into confidence, you should also review - because, ultimately, the buck is passed on to you, and you cannot pass the buck to anybody - what has been their level of the commitment, which they had made at the time of the planning, where is the lack of

resources? And, if there be lack of resources, what medium-term and short-term measures you can take so that, at least, what new concept you have brought that the core plan could be protected so that at the end of year we do not find that year after year we are far short of the projection, which we are having That was the whole objective of my participating in this discussion, while we are having consideration of this Appropriation Bill Thank you, Mr Chairman, Sir

SHRI BIMAL JALAN (Nominated) Thank you, Mr Chairman, Sir I am very fortunate to be speaking after Shri Pranab Mukherjee, one of the most successful Finance Ministers of our country It was also my pleasure to hear the Leader of the Opposition, Dr Manmohan Singh On this side, we have had extremely good points, if I may say so from my personal experience On that side too we have Shri Jaswant Singh and Shri Yashwant Sinha, who have been the other most successful Finance Minister The reason why I am mentioning this is that economic issues - the rate of growth, what we should be tackling, what we should be doing - are in my view non-partisan issues As I listened to Dr Manmohan Singh and Shri Pranab Mukherjee, I can honestly say that all that they have cautioned, all that they have said is absolutely to the point I don't share the view expressed by one of the hon Members of the present ruling party, Shri Balbir Punj, who is also a very good friend of mine, that the point made were political in nature They were not, the points made by the Leader of the Opposition, I think, were absolutely on the dot The analysis may differ, whatever may happen And I will come to a couple of suggestions, and, perhaps, analytically one or two points which would be of interest to them For example, a substantial point made by Dr Manmohan Singh about the trend rate of growth being 5 5 or 5 8 per cent is absolutely right, that one year does not change it We had a very high rate of growth, in one or two years, when Shri Pranab Mukherjee was the Finance Minister, if I recall and I was serving him in some humble capacity at that time So, in one year it is welcome, it is good, but it does not change the trend So, if you want to change the trend, a lot needs to be done Similarly, who can disagree with this whole savings and investment point which was raised by Dr Manmohan Singh, or the most critical aspects on which I will have something to say about the importance of agriculture, irrigation for sustaining the rate of growth in agriculture? One of the weaknesses of our long-term trend rate of growth,

and the reason why we are staying at only 5 8 or 6 per cent, on all economic accounts, and I am sure, Shri Jaswant Singhji would agree, is that the long-term rate of growth in agriculture has not been as robust as it should be despite good monsoon and so on

Similarly, on infrastructure and power, I cannot see anybody disagreeing with the importance of infrastructure In fact, most of the attention of Shri Jaswant Singh has also has been in that area or on the fiscal situation I fully agree with Shri Pranab Mukherjee on this I am saying all this because I want to emphasise that these are non-partisan issues We have, obviously, the question of revenue deficit How are we going to tackle them, what are we going to do? Most of the Appropriation Bills that we are today approving are for, what you might call, revenue expenditure and not for Plan expenditure That is a fact But the issue is that it is not the party in power which can do anything about it I mean, this has been the trend When this political party was not in power, similar issues were raised We had similar subsidy problems We had similar issues that needed to be tackled, but we have not tackled them And so, these are, to my mind, the most important points that need to be tackled The issues are not easy If we want to reduce subsidies, it is not easy It is not easy to reduce food subisidy, it is not easy to reduce fertilizer subsidy, it is not easy to reduce subsidy to the Government sector, it is not easy to reduce PSU subsidies But if we want to tackle them, we need a fully bipartisan approach

Similarly, I agree with Shri Pranab Mukherjee that we should not be complacent It would be most disastrous to be complacent about the present 'feel-good-factor' or what has been happening because a lot more needs to be done I am repeating what they have said, because I agree and I know it for a fact that the present Finance Minister is equally concerned about all the 6 or 7 issues that have been raised Now the question is what to do about them and how to go about it This is really the crux of the matter To my mind, most of the issues are long-term in nature You have to start you have to have a policy, you have to have a ten-year perspective then, and then alone, this can be tackled

Then, there is the issue of agricultural investment There is no way in which in one or two years or a Budget can do it Similarly, infrastructure, and reduction in revenue deficit are there And we need a consensus in this place, at different levels, not only in the House, not only at the Government level but at the level of the Industrial Unions, the corporate sector, and professionals. The crucial thing that we need, and here I want to draw the attention of the Leader of the Opposition, Dr Manmohan Singh also, is the increase in productivity Yes savings rate is important, investment rate is important But recent studies have shown, some of the studies, at least, that in infrastructure we can achieve a two percentage point increase in growth, if we just do the job for which we have money, for which we have savings better than we do today And, the dead-weight losses in our economy, the procedural complexities, the legal complexities, and the institutional complexities are such that they are dragging down the growth rate of our economy, at least by 2 percentage point

So, the first suggestion that I want to make to this august House is to approach these issues in a non-partisan way Consensus may be difficult because the issues are difficult, but if the House agrees, then this can be launched, and this can be done And, if you take a ten years' perspective, there is never a better opportunity than now because all the traditional constraints are no longer there Earlier, if you had a drought, the country would have a crisis, if you had oil price rise, you would have a crisis, if you have Gulf-war, you will have a crisis and the last four crisis were related to one or the other events happening at different points of time Last year, Mr Chairman, we had all the three You had Iraq war, you had drought, you had a substantial increase in oil price Who was complaining about the crisis? Everybody was complaining that our reserves are too much At present India has got a lot of reserves Here, Pranabbabu is right in saying that unless we use reserves effectively, we will have a problem of monitoring, management, and you would have a problem of excess money supply, but the issue to which I want to draw your attention, Sir, is that the opportunity for tackling the kind of problems which have been raised here has never been better than now And, this is the greatest advantage, the greatest opportunity and this is not something, to my mind, which has been achieved in one year I mean, somebody said and rightly so that this has been a continuing thing It was done in 1980 In 80's also, we had the growth rate of 5 8 per

cent We accelerated, we tackled the crisis of 1991 and, now, we have a long-term rate of growth over the last 20 years which is one of the highest in the world but the most important thing is that unlike in the past, in the first 45 years or so, of our Independence, we did not face a potential crisis because something had happened elsewhere So, the time to tackle our problems is now, but the problems are long-term Mr Chairman, Sir, I do not want to take too much of your time but I do want to make two, three suggestions for which we need a consensus First is the tremendous importance of reducing institutional, legal and procedural complexities which are a part of the governmental system today Today, the Attorney-General of India, for example, has said in 'The Indian Express' that the Income-Tax Act is the most complex one in writing, that we have the largest number of sections, the largest number of sub-sections and the largest number of explanations and the largest number of provisos And, I know that I must have added to this complexity in my previous capacity but the main point is that we need a concerted effort on behalf of the Government to authorise the CBDT, so that the complexity is reduced by half atleast in the next year or two There is no reason to have so many provisos, so many clauses and such clauses This is the Attorney-General's opinion and not mine

Second, Sir, is the institutional complexity We have had the debate here Whenever a problem arises, you want to create an institution, say a National Commission or something National, a regulatory body or a regulatory authority but you don't replace anything Look at the area of telecom We had the Telecom Commission, we still have it We had the Telecom Ministry, we still have it But we said we must have a regulatory body, so we have TRAI Then, we said, we must have an appellate body, we have IDSAC Then, we said, we must have the policy making body, which is a Group of Minister, we have it, then we have the whole legal infrastructure which we used to have before Similarly, the power issue was raised and this is one of the most fundamental issues We had Central Eelctricity Authority earlier, we had State Eelectricity Boards, we have Power Ministries in the State, we have the Power Ministry at the Centre Though we had CERC, whatever it is called, we have now added State Electricity Authority but we have not eliminated anybody All the Acts are in place, Everything is in place We just added on So, Sir the second suggestion or third suggestion, whatever it is, that I want

to make, through this House, is that whenever you set up an institution, one of the most important question that the Ministers or those who are setting up that istitution should be asked to answer is which institution are they replacing? Similarly, if you look at the legal system of today you will find that everyday, there is an avalanche of laws

Every Session there are many more laws, many more things, all well-intentioned I have not yet seen a law which says that I am doing someting wrong' You are always adding on taking public interest, but the complexity had increased Today, for example, you may have placed all the documents on the Table of the House, but I challenge whether any Member of this House read all these documents which have been laid on the Table of the House. They are running into 6-7 pages You look at the Bills Today, they are considering 3-4 Bills Now, all are well-intentioned But have you replaced anything? Something is happening for 1884 Act or the 1992 Act But while looking at these Acts, you should see that legal complexity has to be reduced I am saying this because if you just do these things, you will get at least 1 5 percentage point increase in growth rate I have no doubt about it at all because, in this way, you reduce the time-spent, you reduce the complexity One project paper moved in the Planning Commission- I remember it because I did this exercise once when I was there-something like 267 point it moved and no answer was there at the end of it, when the project was still under consideration . I forget what the issues were There is one more important thing which only the Government can do, and that is agriculture It is one of those areas where a very pro-active role of the State is required Although it is a State subject but at the Central Government level, at the State Governments level, at all levels agriculture is one area where the infrastructure is weak, where water supply is weak We have to involve NGOs We have to increase the investments I would, therefore, say to the Finance Minister as well as the opposition that eight per cent growth is not a partisan issue it is not the Prime Minister's issue It is not an issue of the present party It is an issue for our country

I believe and earnestly belive that we can achieve eight per cent rate of growth, but we cannot achieve eight per cent rate of growth, by going on like we are doing We can achieve eight per cent rate of growth, if we take advantage of the present opportunity to reduce the kind of roadblock

the kind of trenches that we have created We have created multiple barriers on the road to growth over a period of time, over the last 50-60 years of institutional, legal and procedural complexities Agriculture is one area where only the States can act because there is no other institution which can provide the irrigation The public irrigation has gone down Everybody knows that We have not been able to do it This is something that I would suggest I do not want to suggest a Commission or a Group or a Committee for that purpose What I would suggest is that the Finance Minister and the Minister of Agriculture, with the help of all State Ministers assigned with this task, should have a programme of let us say, public irrigation to be increased by 50 per cent, the tubewell rate of failure to be reduced by 50 per cent in the next three years or four years So, if we can solve the water problem, it can be done The availability of fertiliser is not a problem, and if we can supply fertiliser, the things can improve Now, about the rural roads, The other day, some statistics were given We have done a lot on the highways But we have not spent the money that we had on rural roads Mr Chairman, I do not want to take much more of your time

To summarise, I would say that this is something that the Finance Minister shares, that the issues are complex, long-term, which require consensus The second is that we can do it India is not down and out India is not a country which can be bypassed The third thing is that we need a will to do it, and the most important thing that the Government can do is to reduce the complexities, to reduce the fifty years of moss which has, somehow, gathered in the paths of our, citizens, in the ways of our farmers, in the ways of our corporations in doing what they have to do

SHRI C RAMACHANDRAIAH (Andhra Pradesh) Thank you, Sir, for this opportunity After the participation of eminent persons like Shri Pranab Mukherjee and Shri Bimal Jalan, I feel rather weak in expressing my views

Sir, we are happy that the foreign exchange reserves have reached up beyond $ 100 billions, equivalent to 20 months' imports; more than 1 5 times of what is generally perceived as liquidity, and almost ten times the annual debt service burden It is a remarkable upswing from the 1991 situation, when we were compelled to mortage the gold reserves

to create credit, and when the country was hardly in possession of foreign exchange reserves

Sir, as far as inflation is concerned, there is a promise that it will be brought down to 4 per cent by the end of the year, and the stock markets, are happy as Sensex stands at 5500 points, which is a 45 months high The GDP is estimated to grow at 7 per cent, as against 4 3 per cent of the previously year All this has created a feel-good factor, I do admit The Finance Minister had recently observed, 'why should we feel guilty about feeling good? It is absolutely not necessary

But in spite of all these things, if you analyse the situation, if you go into the depth of the economic conditions that are prevailing at this juncture, there are some vital issues which remain to be addressed and resloved The GDP growth rate, which is so essential for improving the quality of life of the people of this country, should be 8 per cent, rather, more than 8 per cent And it should be more than 8 per cent for the next two decades, so that we can bring the people out of the poverty conditions But the fact remains, Sir, that during the last six years, that is the period from 1998 to 2004 taken as a whole the GDP growth rate has not been more than 5 5 per cent, even after taking into consideration the prospect of GDP growth rate touching 7 per cent for the current financial year *Prima facie*, although this entitles the country to be bracketed among the ten fastest growing economies in the world, going by our *per capita* income and level of FDI, the least we need to achieve is 8 per cent GDP growth rate

What is depressing is that the GDP growth rate, which was 6 8 per cent for the entire Eighth Plan, and around 7 3 per cent for the first three years of the Eighth Plan, has fallen to a meagre 5 3 per cent in the next seven years. But I am happy that the Government is initiating certain measures in correct direction

Sir, it was said that foreign exchange reserves of more than $100 billion were at our command But if you look into what constitutes this surplus, it is not very encouraging Are we surplus in foreign trade accounts? Our foreign trade deficit was $8 billion in 2001-02 and $9 billion in 2002-03 The same has already touched $7 billion in the first half of the current year, as on Septemeber 2003 So, the fact that despite such huge trade deficits being registered year after year the foreign

exchange reserves are growing clearly indicates that it is hot money which has constituted this finding its way into the country This is essentially because of the interest arbitrage or interest differential or foreign institutional investments in stock exchange markets Despite all the confidence, despite all high hopes that are encouraging for the country, the country continues to have the least amount of foreign direct investment, especially the manufacturing sector that creates employment and generates revenue for the country

Sir, now I come to the fiscal position of both the Central and the State Governments It has deteriorated over the last five years The total deficit of the State and the Centre put together has exceeded 10 per cent and the State's financial position is highly precarious Even in the current year, the fiscal deficit up to Septemeber 2003 was Rs 81,014 crore, that is 52 7 per cent of the current year's Budget expenditure which is much higher compared to the corresponding period of the last year The same is the case with revenue deficit Sir, fiscal deficit is okay It is a developing economy where we number of times advise the Government to borrow more to create capital assets in this country which is the need of the hour But the demon is revenue deficit We cannot afford to borrow and spend for revenue purposes without creating capital assets That is the most dangerous thing which has to be arrested The revenue deficit which has been estimated to be at Rs 65,247 crore, constituting 58 3 per cent of the Budget compared to 49 9 per cent, the Budget itself is more by 9 per cent

(The Deputy Chairman in the Chair)

So, this clearly belies the claim of the Government that the fiscal management of the country improved over the years We cannot successfully or authoritatively say that the financial position has been improved A lot has to be done As far as public expenditure is involved, it is a worsening situation that is prevailing in the country because of so many factors We can justify As Shri Bimal Jalan has been telling with regard to subsidy it is very difficult to phase out subsidies whether it is food, or fertilizer or power But it has to be done, it has to be rationalised for which there should be a national consensus We cannot play politics with the power, which is the vital sector for the growth of the economy In States like Andhra Pradesh where we have been very aggressively

implementing reforms, which is being taken advantage by the other political parties, we are paying political price for it So, what I am trying to say is that there should be a national consensus on the issues which affect the total and overall economy of the States and the country Sir, in spite of the bad agricultural years, we were able to achieve the growth rate of 5 29 per cent But even today, the farming community in this country is not insulated from the vagaries of monsoon So, to ensure their access to water the Government has to reorient its policies towards agriculture The primacy has to be given to agriculture because 66 per cent of the population still depends on agriculture and around 25 per cent of the contribution is coming from agriculture to the GDP So, the growth rate is there But growth should be employment-oriented Let us not create islands of prosperity amidst ocean of poverty The fruits of reforms have to benefit every citizen of this country, not a particular group of individuals or a particular section of the people Sir, we have been very happy that the Sensex has reached 5500 marks I am very unhappy, honestly speaking, keeping in view of the experience in 2001 The regulators—the Company Law Board or the RBI— were not vigilant in controlling all this So, I quote one example when I weigh 100 kg, what should be my reaction? I should go to the doctor to see why I am weighing 100 kg So, introspection has to be done What I am trying to say is that bull market is not reflecting on the fundamentals of the economy There is not much industrial growth, there is not much agricultural growth except, to a certain extent, in service sector Then, how these stock prices are going on So, keeping in view our experience, Ketan Parekh's experience, we should be very vigilant and as I have been telling for the past couple of years, the Government should re-orientate its policies towards farming community Madam, farmers are the miserable lot in this country (Time-bell) Madam, I need five minutes

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN I have other Members also

SHRI C RAMACHANDRAIAH I am happy that the Finance Minister has gone on record saying that we are embarking on the Second Green Revolution That is the need of the hour But, I want to make some suggestions You better concentrate on the productivity of the farmer The country may be self-sufficient in foodgrains, but not every farmer is self-sufficient The country, as a whole, is self-sufficient Now, this Government has to deal very wisely with this paradoxical situation of

surplus foreign exchange, foodgrains, etc Because, agriculture is the main driver of the Indian economy, keeping in view the huge population, which depend on agriculture So, provide more funds for value addition, processing industries, diversifying agricultural activities, ascertain the need of the nation What are the exact requirements? So, let us not have the lopsided policy Let us be very rational So, my sincere request to the Government is that they should pay more attention to the agriculture credit It is true that the RBI has given direction that agriculture credit should be 18 per cent of the total credit extended by scheduled commercial banks, but nowhere 18 per cent has been achieved In fact, the actual credit flow to agriculture sector from scheduled commercial banks is somewhere around 9 per cent only And, virtually, we are sending all these poor farmers to the fold of conventional moneylenders in the villages who have been exploiting this farming community since a long time

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Mr Ramachandraiah, I have somemore speakers, and then, we have a very long discussion on the stamp paper scam So, please, can you conclude?

SHRI C RAMACHANDRAIAH Reforms are there, and the second-generation reforms, whatever you call it, they are essential But, before doing it, we should ensure that the economic conditions of the farmers should grow Only then, there will be aggregate demand for goods in this country Only then, the industrial activity will pick up The huge population, when you improve the economic conditions of the farming community, they will have some surplus, which can be saved and diverted to productive purposes There will be a demand for goods that will kick-start the economy so that there is more industrial activity, more capital that will be procured from the public to the industrial activity And, one more suggestion that I want to make is that there is a strong complimentality factor between the private and public investment So, let us not be in slumber that because we have privatised, we have globalised, everything will be taken care of by the private sector Public investment should also be there Only then, we can attract the private investment by providing infrastructural facilities Madam, last suggestion that I want to make

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN You have taken more time

SHRI C RAMACHANDRAIAH We should make India the best outsourcing centre. It has got all potentialities The only thing is that we should project India in a proper way. I have been touring so many counties because of the Committee work It is seen that industrially, India is a very poorly projected nation May be culturally, it is known in so many countries, but because of our red-tapism and othere things, we have not projected India properly. We should be the best salesmen We should project our India It should be made a window and we should make it the best outsourcing centre so that more employment and more revenues can be generated

DR T SUBBARAMI REDDY (ANDHRA PRADESH) . Madam, Deputy Chairman, I thank you for the opportunity given to me to speak on this Bill Firstly, I am very happy to join our leader Shri Pranab ji to congratulate the hon. Finance Minister, our good friend, for having achieved spectacular results of foreign exchange reserves I also congratulate the Government as today definitely the capital market is getting improved, the steal industry is very strong and going well, and, the overall system is slowly looking up In this connection, Madam, I would like to bring to the notice of the hon Finace Minister that actually the GDP, the employment growth, the per capita income and the national growth are all interlinked with the industrial growth, industrial production, and agricultural production. I would like the hon Finance Minister to see that in the last five years how many new industries have come up Particularly, if you do not concentrate on the core industry, you cannot achieve employment growth No doubt, now, the information technology sector is blooming up, the telecom sector is doing well We are extremely happy But at the same time, the real massive employment to which the Government is committed and dreaming, will not be achieved, and you will not be successful unless the core industries come up

As on today, if you see the country's position, almost every industry is in bad shape since several years, and even today. For example, take the textile sector, take the paper sector, take the cement sector or take the sugar sector, it is in very bad shape. All is in bad shape And, no new unit in this core industry is coming up So, what is the solution? My suggestion is that we must concentrate on core industries

Secondly, to get a new industry, the basic pillars are the financial institutions, and the public participation For the last few years public is not participating at all in buying the shares Apart from this, the premier institutions like IDBI are in totally difficult shape Now, it has become a bank We are happy that it is going to be better ICICI has also become a bank Now, virtually, except IFCI, there is no financial institution So, my suggestion to Jaswant ji is that unless a strong financial institution is there you cannot dream to have new industries The Banking system is different, and the working of institutions is different

Now, IDBI and ICICI have become banks Yes, we welcome it We have supported the Bill, and we passed the Bill It is important But the only left over institution is the Industrial Finance Corporation of India, the IFCI So, at least, let us make IFCI a strong self-sufficient financial institution with the help of the Government, and give an indication to the industry in the country, 'yes, come on, this institution will support you ' I understand it is growing well It is coming out of the problems after steel industry and other industries are coming up Therefore, this is my suggestion

Madam, the next point is the most important point Mr Punj was actually taking the credit, and was saying that the present Government is responsible for the cars manufacturing and exports But, here, I must say that the first credit goes to Dr Manmohan Singh, who was the Finance Minister at the time Before he took over as the Finance Minister, we used to have only Fiat cars, Ambassadors After that, it was made liberal, and at that time, he allowed the cars manufacturing all over the world, and also the imports exports, all have been improved Today, we are happy Of course, it has improved much more So, the credit goes to Dr Manmohan Singh ji and the Congress Government of that time

Now, one more thing that Mr Punj was saying is that the Opposition is coming in the way of the economic development It is totally wrong I must say that the Congress Party has always been conscious, cautious, judicious, practical, and positive in giving full support to the Government, wherever required in building of this great country So, you cannot say this If you see the passed Bills in the Rajya Sabha—though we have a majority to have a say in passing of Bills we are always

welcoming whenever you are doing anything constructive So, it is not correct say that we are coming in the way

Madam, one more thing that I want to speak about is the inflation Well inflation is very, very ticklish in a sense A common man, lay man thinks, if inflation is not much, we are very safe, very happy No, it is not correct Inflation is just like the body temperature If the body temperature is 100 and above, you suffer from fever If it goes down below a certain level, it is also dangerous for the body Similarly, if the inflation in a country's economy goes down beyond a certain level, it is very bad

Recently, for several years, inflation has been going down It has been about 3-4 per cent It is not a good indication The moment the buying power has gone down in the Indian economy, automatically inflation has also gone down I do not wish inflation should go up abnormally at about 15-20 per cent, but it should go reasonably You must increase the buying power of the people also. So, I would suggest that you must bear in mind that inflation should be rationally maintained, it should neither be too high nor too low In conclusion, I would like to know one more thing In the Bill, for the steel sector about Rs 230 crores have been allocated Now, steel is doing exceedingly well and almost everything is self-sufficient So, I would like to know what is the requirement again to provide about Rs. 950 crores Lastly, Mr Punj said that everything is prosperous and our Leftist friend said it is not correct But, I would say that, definitely, the Government must make much more efforts One Member said there is no employment, other Member said, there is not much growth in the industry There are actually either calamities or over production or less production Price control is not there Farmers are committing suicides All these facts have to be borne in mind Also Laluji was emphasising about giving more assistance to Bihar I fully agree with him Bihar and Madhya Pradesh are two States which are the biggest States in the Country When Jharkhand and Chhatisgarh were carved out of these States, it so happened that all the important minerals and power projects were in the territories of newly formed States So, the small States took away main resources of the big states If the two big States are left without much resources, the Government, in their planning and in their Budget, must give special consideration and more financial support Lastly, I will talk about Andhra

Pradesh Now a serious crisis is there because of the cyclone I demand of the Government to sent immediately at least Rs 500 crores for providing help and for undertaking immediate rehabilitation works in the affected areas. I do not repeat that so many people died and so many have been rendered homeless So, I want answeres to all these things With this, I support the bill Thank You, Madam

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Thank you Mr Virumbi, you have just seven minutes

SHRI S VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI (Tamil Nadu) Madam, I hope that you will be considerate to me

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN You can take less time and I will happy

SHRI S VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI (Tamil Nadu) Madam, Deputy Chairperson, due to time constraint, now, I have decided not to go through the macro-economic policies I would like to go through problem specific and project specific ones Even then, I have to deal with one or two items in the economic field Madam, our mid-term industrial production index for 2003-04 showed 5 8 per cent as compared to the 5 4 per cent in the last year Madam, the fiscal deficit for the current year of the Budget, up to Septemer, that is first half, is 52 7 per cent Last year, for the same period, it was only 42 6 per cent Madam, the revenue deficit up to September is about 58 3 per cent, that is about Rs 65,427 crores, when the fiscal deficit was Rs 81, 014 crores Last year, the revenue deficit was only 49 9 per cent The one appreciable thing is the rupee appreciated, in a short span, to about 7 per cent, and that helped, I hope the importers Madam, regarding rural credit through the institutional credit flow we must appreciate that in the Ninth Plan, it was about Rs 2,29,853 crores Now, it has been increased, and approved by the Planning Commission by 320 per cent, that is Rs 7,36,570 crores, in which what I have to say is that we must see that we give more emphasis on agriculture, because the country's economy is based on the agricultural economy The problem is sometimes the order issued by some bank for that, Madam, Reserve Bank has given some instructions Now, the agriculture loan won't go directly to the State apex or to the bank It is going to reach through district cooperative banks

NABARD will give only to district cooperative banks, it won't touch the apex banks In that case, the State Government will remain in dark But, at the same time, the State Government has to give the guarantee to the cooperative banks If the NABARD wants do deal with the district cooperative banks, their intention is good because they want to avoid the overhead costs They are doing it from that point of view But the real problem is, when NABARD approaches the district cooperative banks, without touching the apex banks, the State Government may not come forward with the guarantee. But NABARD, as per its rules and regulations, would not give loan to the district cooperative banks without guarantee Ultimately, the agriculturists would be the sufferers This is the situation I hope you will consider this aspect

Now, I come to the specific issues regarding tea During the year 2002-03, up to October, tea exports were of the order of 120 73 million kg In 2003-04, exports have come down to 94 63 million kg Madam, our tea exports to Iraq, as we all know, have been badly affected I want to bring it to the notice of the hon. Finance Minister that there is shortage of tea in Rumania If we approach the Rumanian Government, through our Indian Embassy There, we may get some export orders

Madam, our tea production in 2002-03 was 826 million kgs At that time we had exported 120 million kgs Now, the produciton is increased annually at the rate of about 3 per cent But exports have come down In Ootty, in my own State, nearly 60,000 agriculturists are suffering because of this I think the Government will consider it as an important issue

Then, Madam, it is regarding foundries The Coimbatore Tiny and Small Foundry Owners' Association have already submitted a memorandum to the Government of India Nearly 600 foundry units are in Tamil Nadu About 4,00,000 people are relying upon those foundry units The problem is that the raw material prices have more or less doubled Madam, in December, 2002, the pig iron rate was Rs 8500 per metric tonne It has now gone up to Rs 16,000 The rate of coke, which is a raw material, in December, 2002 was Rs 7500 per metric tonne, it has now gone up to Rs 14,000 the rate of

3 00 P M

scrap in 2002 was Rs 7500 per metric tonne it has now gone up to Rs 13,000 Within a year, the increase has been of the order of 40 to 80 per cent Madam, why I am pointing out this is because today, on the 22nd of this month, all the factories are closed in protest against this inaction of the Governments Madam, all these factories at Coimbatore supply material, on long-term contract basis, to automobile industry, Railways BHEL, BEML and so on If prices have increased by 80 per cent, how can they can execute their contracts? Madam, for this purpose, the Government has to revamp its Export Policy in such a way that the customs duty is reduced As far as the excise duty is concerned, although it should be abolished on a permanent basis, still, at least for the time being, it should be reduced to zero, so that these four lakh families could be saved

Madam, now they wanted to modernise the gold and jewellery industry But when you modernise, thousands of families will become jobless I think the Government will take this fact into account that modernisation should take place in such a way that traditional artisans are not affected

3 00 P M

Madam, I come to textiles The price of one 355 kg candy of cotton has been raised up to Rs, 5000 Often there has been an increase in the diesel prices and, consequently, the freight charges have gone up Now, one lorry carries 50 bales of cotton Charging Rs 16000, to Rs 25,000 Therefore, in respect of one candy of 355 kg of cotton, the cost of transport comes to Rs 1200 This means Rs 5000 plus Rs 1200 it comes to Rs 6200 Forty to fifty lakhs bales of cotton are transported Therefore, I request the Government of India to see to it that the Railways, like in the case of steel and cement also help in this area If the Railways come forward, the transport charges will come down from Rs 1500 to Rs 700 and this would help the textile industry Madam, for textiles I have already requested that the excise duty should be reduced from 4 per cent to 2 per cent

But instead of reducing it to two per cent the excise duty was raised to 8 per cent It is now 9 2 per cent or nearly 10 per cent I request the Finnce Minister to reconsider it I also request him, through

the Chair, that he should invite the people from (i) the mill sector, (ii) the powerloom sector and (iii) the handloom sector together, not one by one and discuss the matter with them All these people should sit with the Finance Minister simultaneously All these people are facing the problems Because of the price-hike, the powerloom sector is facing the problem Because of a rise in the price of yarn, the handloom weavers are facing the problems I hope the Finance Minister will take it very seriously, and the problem will be solved

Madam, the next item is sugar The production of sugar in India has declines I appreciate the Government because they have come forward with subsidy for sugar as a fall in prices noticed In this situation, the export subsidy given is Rs 350 per tonne The Government, in principle, has approved an amount of Rs 2,563 crores by way of Central Assistance to the State Governments They have actually allocated Rs 1,400 crores for the Sugar Development Fund Out of Rs 1,400 crores, they have already taken Rs 700 crores Alongwith that, some commercial banks are also asked to help the sugar factories The Central assistance is given at four per cent interest We want to have a categorical reply, State-wise how much amount has been availed by the State Governments and whether, by providing this amount at a concessional rate of interest of four per cent, are you going to offset the balance due to the sugarcane growers I think this amount is being paid to the sugarcane growers only to give their dues I request the Government to also monitor whether the agriculturists have actually got the money Madam, apart from that, the cess was only Rs 14/- Now, it has been raised to Rs 20/- All of a sudden, it is increased by Rs 6 I hope the Government will try to see what the ground reality is When they are not able to sell sugar in the market, when they ae struggling for exports, when they are expecting some subsidy for export, you are raising the cess! I want to know from the Finance Minister how such a decision has been taken

Regarding the Salem Steel Plant, Madam, it is going to be, more or less, closed down because of the policy of the Finance Department SAIL has given loan to other units, particularly to those which are situated in the North, from their own resources SAIL is giving them loans by borrowing money from the open market That is why, they are now incurring losses I request the Finance Minister, through the Chair,

to see to it that SAIL comes forward to raise the loan money from their own sources and the interest amount is saved

The next point is about the recovery of debts The total amount of recovery due, throughout India, is Rs 11,447 crores Thirty thousand notices have been issued by the banks Out of Rs. 11,447 crores, the banks are able to collect only Rs 398 crores, i e 3 4 per cent of the total amount As regards the State Bank of India, the balance is Rs 3,794 crores But they were able to collect, after the Securitisation Act, only Rs 34 crores Therefore, there is some lacuna there We are for the lenders I hope the government will find it out and solve the problem, and see to it that the balance money is collected

Madam, I now come to the cement industry In 2002-03, the cement production of industries was growing at 8 4 per cent In 2003-04, the rate of production has come down to 4 9 per cent They have arbitrarily increased the amount by Rs 40 to Rs 60 This shows the performance of the industries The production, this year, is only 59 71 million tonnes I request the Finance Minister, through the Chair, to find out whether they have filled up the gap in the production capacity I quote a few lines stated by one of the Members of the Consultative Committee concerning the Ministry of Finance What is the present position of the State Governments? (Time bell) Madam, I request you to give me two minutes more I am not repeating anything I am making separate points Please give me two minutes more

"The outstanding debt of the States, including Reserve Funds & Deposits but excluding ways and means advances from RBI, was Rs 1,83,049 crores It constituted 23 4 per cent of GDP at the end of 1993-94 Over the next nine years, the debt jumped to Rs 6,71,653 crores, constituting 29 8 per cent of GDP"

They had given the guarantee of Rs 1,66,000 crores Therefore, I appreciate what the Government has done But there is still more to be done because the burden of interest has now been put on the shoulders of State Governments

Madam, as far as the Ninth Plan is concerned, even the Planning Commission has appreciated the fact that resource mobilisation has been done in a proper manner so far as the State of Tamil Nadu is concerned As far as development in the Ninth Plan is concerned, we

have actually surpassed the all-India level The all-India level was 5 5 per cent, whereas the State of Tamil Nadu had achieved a rate of growth of 6 2 per cent Then, earlier, 35 per cent people were Below the Poverty Line, this figure had been reduced to 21 per cent Despite all these achievements, our State has been suffering I request the Central Government to come forward and help the State Governments

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Mr Virumbi, please conclude You still have four papers in your hand.

SHRI S VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI I have only two points, Madam. One is regarding agriculture in Tamil Nadu. We have this longstanding Cauvery river water dispute The people are suffering. The people of the Cauvery delta are agitating daily They have been requesting the Central Government to convene a meeting of the Cauvery River Water Authority in this regard The agriculture in the Cauvery delta area must be saved The standing crops there have to be saved The Central government should take the necessary action Then, my last point is about cross-holdings among the oil companies The Government has decided to allow cross-holdings among the oil companies and the Government can, thereby, realise Rs 17,456 crores, out of which the Government of India will have a capital gain of Rs 12,811 crores The capital gains tax will be of the order of Rs 1281, but these oil companies will be privatised once and for all So, it is not going to take care ofthe public interest Therefore, all these things should be looked into and the economy of the country should be saved. With these words, I conclude

उपसभापति: श्री बशिष्ठ नारायण सिंह आप सक्षेप में बोल दीजिए क्योंकि मंत्री जी का जवाब भी आना है।

श्री बशिष्ठ नारायण सिंह (बिहार): धन्यवाद उपसभापति महोदया, मैं वित्त मंत्री जी को और सरकार को एक बात के लिए बधाई देना चाहता हूं कि आर्थिक क्षेत्र में गाड़ी पटरी पर दिखाई पड़ रही है। महोदया, गाड़ी पटरी पर दिखाई पड़ रही है,यह कहने के कुछ तर्क हैं जिन पर शायद सबकी सहमति होगी। देश में एक वातावरण जरूर तैयार हुआ है। और विश्वास का वातावरण इस मायने में तैयार हुआ है कि इस देश में भी इनवेस्टमेंट किया जा सकता है और कई स्तरों पर सरकार की ओर से और कई कम्पनियों की ओर से देश में इसके चिन्ह दिखाई पड़ रहे हैं। चाहे आईओसी का मामला हो, चाहे बालको का हो, चाहे नालको का हो, चाहे टाटा कैमीकल्स का हो, कई

कम्पनियों ने इस देश में बड़े इनवेस्टमेंट करने की योजना बनायी है। इस प्रकार देश की आर्थिक स्थिति रिकवरी की ओर है, इस पर कोई संदेह नहीं दिखाई पड़ता है। कुछ क्षेत्रों में कुछ ऐसे काम हुए हैं।

महोदया, जब भी किसी विशेष विषय पर बहस होगी तो तीन बिन्दु खींचे जा सकते हैं जिनके आधार पर बहस प्रारम्भ की जाए। पहला, वित्त मंत्री ने जब चार्ज लिया हो, उसके पहले देश की स्थिति क्या थी? दूसरा जब वित्त मंत्री चार्ज में हैं, उस समय देश की आर्थिक स्थिति क्या है और तीसरा देश की आर्थिक योजना और आर्थिक नीति क्या है और देश को किधर ले जाना चाहते हैं। इन तीन कोणों पर विचार किया जा सकता है और तभी किसी आर्थिक नीति की परीक्षा की जा सकती है। लेकिन आज इस पर जरूर विचार करने की जरूरत है कि आज हम कहां खड़े हैं और कहा जाना चाहते हैं। इस प्रकार नेशनल ग्रोथ रेट की जब बात की जाए तो इकनॉमिक रिकवरी की बात नेशनल ग्रोथ रेट को देखने से पता चलती है। यदि हम मुद्रा भंडार की बात करते हैं, उसको देखने के बाद स्पष्ट प्रमाण मिलता है कि हमारी आर्थिक स्थिति अच्छी हो रही है। और देश की नीति और कार्य-योजना के ऊपर यदि हम विचार करते हैं तो हमको लगता है कि जहां हम लोगों ने पहले कुछ खोया था, जो हम लोगों ने भूलें की थीं, उन भूलों से हम लोगों ने सबक लेने की कोशिश की है।

उपसभापति महोदया, कुछ योजनाओं का मैं विशेष उल्लेख करना चाहता हू-एक प्रधानमंत्री जी क' ग्रामीण विकास योजना और दूसरा बिजली के क्षेत्र में जो कदम उठाए गए हैं, तीसरा, शिक्षा के क्षेत्र में जो कदम उठाए गए हैं--इनसे लगता है कि देश की जो बीमारी है, उस बीमारी को कम से कम परखने का, उसको जांचने का और उसके मर्ज की दवा खोजने का प्रयास किया गया है। यदि अच्छा रेट होगा तो गांव का किसान अपनी फसल को ले जाकर शहर में बेच सकता है। यदि बिजली की स्थिति अच्छी होगी तो पैदावार भी बढ़ सकती है और छोटे-मोटे उद्योग भी खड़े हो सकते हैं। इसकी ओर देश को देखने का और ले जाने का प्रयास किया गया है लेकिन देश में कुछ ऐसे संकेत भी मिले हैं जिनकी ओर वित्त मंत्री जी को ध्यान देना चाहिए। एक बात मुझे जरूर लगती है कि यदि उस बात को मैं कहूंगा तो यूटोपियन लग सकता है लेकिन उसके ऊपर भी विचार करना चाहिए और वह है खर्च पर सीमा बांधने की जरूरत। इस पर मैं विस्तार से तो चर्चा नहीं करूंगा। खर्च पर सीमा बांधने की बात जब होगी तो इकानॉमी को दूसरी दृष्टि से और कानून को नए ढंग से ले जाने की जरूरत पड़ेगी--उस पर मैं अभी विशेष बात नहीं करूंगा लेकिन खर्च पर सीमा की बात यदि देश में उठ जाए तो एक बहुत बड़ी बात हो सकती है और आर्थिक क्रांति हो सकती है। देश को नए ढंग से आगे ले जाया जा सकता है। (समय की घंटी) , लेकिन मैडम, हम दो-तीन बातों की ओर विशेष ध्यान देना चाहते हैं। इस सदन में बेरोजगारी पर चर्चा हुई और अभी कुछ ही दिन पहले रेलवे रिक्रूटमेंट पॉलिसी पर चर्चा चल रही थी। एक महत्वपूर्ण इनफॉर्मेशन

सदन में आई कि 20,000 नौकरियों के लिए 55 लाख वैलिड ऐप्लीकेशन्स पाए गए थे। इसका मतलब बेरोजगारी.. (व्यवधान)... 70 लाख ऐप्लीकेशन्स की नहीं, मैं वैलिड ऐप्लीकेशन्स की बात कह रहा हूं। 70 लाख के करीब ऐप्लीकेशन्स पहल आई। जो छंटी हैं, मैं उनकी चर्चा नहीं कर रहा हू। तो देश की इकानॉमी को बेरोजगारी का निदान करने के लिए उधर ले जाने की जरूरत है। इसके लिए मैं वित्त मत्री जी से कहना चाहता हू कि बडे पैमाने पर जितना इनवेस्टमेंट बडे लोग और बडी कंपनियां कर रही हैं, उससे अधिक ध्यान इस पर दिलवाने की कोशिश कीजिए कि गांव के लघु उद्योगों, कुटीर उद्योगों और ग्रामीण उद्योगों की आप बड़े पैमानें पर कैसे वृद्धि करा सकते हैं। अनइम्प्लॉयमेंट को खत्म कराने के लिए कैसी योजना आप बना सकते हैं इसके ऊपर यदि देश की अर्थव्यवस्था को ले जाने का काम करेंगे तो एक बहुत बड़ी बात हो सकती है क्योंकि अभी वही एक स्कोप बचा है। आर्थिक स्थिति में सुधार जरूर हुआ लेकिन अनइम्प्लॉयमेंट बढता जाए तो देश के लिए खतरा है (समय की घटी) एक बात लालू जी कह रहे थे कि बिहार को बडे पैमाने पर पैकेज दिया। मैडम, एक मिनट और लूंगा। मैं पूर्णत: उनसे सहमति व्यक्त करता हू लेकिन उससे भी बडा सवाल एक है कि जो पैसे जाएं, उसका प्रॉपर युटिलाइजेशन हो, समय पर वे खर्च हो जाएं इसका रिजल्ट ओरिएंटेड इनवेस्टमेंट हो, इस पर भी ध्यान देने की जरूरत है। समय कम है और आपकी वार्निंग को मैं समझ रहा हूं कि मुझे अपनी बात समाप्त करनी चाहिए। मैं केवल इतना कहकर अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूं कि आर्थिक नियोजन की योजना इस देश में इस ढंग से बनाई जाए जिसमें निर्धनता रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों को उम्मीद की किरण दिखाई पड़े गरीब और बेरोजगार नौजवानों को कम से कम आशा की किरण दिखाई पड सके, झोपडियों में रहने वाले लोगों को आशा की किरण दिखाई पड़ सके और गाव के गरीब लोगों के लिए जो झोंपडियों में रहते हैं, उनको दिखाई पडे कि इस देश की अर्थव्यवस्था में हमारी तसवीर भी कहीं दिखाई पड़ती है। केवल बडे लोगों की तसवीर ही दिखाई नहीं पड़ती है। इसलिए देश की अर्थव्यवस्था को नए ढग से उधर ले जाने की कोशिश करनी चाहिए। मुझको लगता है कि देश की अर्थव्यवस्था में सुधार के जो उपाय किए गए हैं, इस सुधार के परिणामस्वरूप ग्रामीण अर्थव्यवस्था को नए ढंग मे संवारने में मदद मिलेगी, धन्यवाद।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Hon Members, there is a problem The Finance Minister, after replying has to go for an annual lecture And we have a discussion on Telgi How can he be at two places at one time? We may have to shift the business

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI JASWANT SINGH) Madam, when the discussion on the fake stamp papers scame had been fixed, I have no knowledge that it is being so arranged The annual lecture of the Intelligence Bureau is a lecture that is fixed many months in advance

They had sought my convenience I had consented to go there and share my thoughts with them I am, of course, a servant of the House But . (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Those commitments are also important for the Finance Minister

SHRI JASWANT SINGH I have to fulfil those responsibilities also

उपसभापति: आप यह जवाब दीजिए, meanwhile, I will settle it *(Interruptions)* अभी इन्हें बोलने दीजिए। Let me work it out आप बैठिए। पहले ये जवाब दे दें इसके बाद मैं कुछ करती हू। I will find some way

SHRI SATISH PRADHAN Madam, tomorrow is the last day of this session

SHRI JASWANT SINGH Madam Deputy Chairman, I am very greateful to all the hon Members, who have so kindly participated in this discussion I am also greateful to the hon Members for the kind words, which they have said on the foreign exchange reserve position of the country

(THE VICE-CHAIRMAN, SHRI RAMA SHANKER KAUSHIK, in the chair) It would be a very great error individually on the part of any Finance Minister that this is some kind of personal secorecard It is not a cricket game that I have been playing This is a contribution that has been made by many, above all, Governor of the Reserve Bank of India, my most distinguished predecessors So, it is a matter of gratification for all, because I believe that whereas there are attendant issues of management, as we transit from an economy of want and shortage to an economy of plenty, there are the management issues And, there are management issues of how to utilize the foreign exchange reserve of hundred billion dollars This reserve will continue to grow But, nevertheless, to my mind, it is a very important psychological quotient for the whole country because it bolsters the self confidence of the country as to from where we were earlier to where we are today It is no single Finance Minister's achievement I am grateful to the hon Members for what they have said in this regard Let me congratulate Dr. Bimal Jalan for his maiden speech in the House We are very grateful to him for his wise words I am also very grateful to Dr Manmohan Singh,

Shri Pranab Mukherjee, Shri C Ramachandraiah, and others They are all prominent economists And, as a non-economist, a complete illiterate in the field of economics, it was only with a great deal of hesitation that I venture to offer my reactions I would also like to offer my congratulations to Mr Virumbi The notice board informed me that it is his birthday, today But, unfortunately, he is not here, now

Sir, as happened, through the discussion on the Supplementary Demands for Grant, which are really only five in number, because the Mid-Year Review got added on to it, and quite rightly, thereafter, hon Members have really spoken what they wanted to speak That also, often hapens in the House We start in one direction, and rather like the Ganga, as it is coming towards the *Ganga Sagar,* spreads out in many streams, discussions also, quite often, in the House tend to become like that But Dr Manmohan singh, with his great experience in the House, in the Ministry, and elsewhere, raised the issues, with which I could not have disagreed, because these are issues that are issues of my concern, as they were issues of his concern, when he was the Finance Minister तुलसी जी एक बड़ा अच्छा पद है। अनायास ही याद आता है 'पर उपदेश कुशल बहुतेरे, जे आचरे नर न घनेरे।'

I could very well have said what Dr Manmohan singh has himself said, except, perhaps, Sir, it is disappointing, it is also disheartening, if a distinguished Leader of the Opposition, a renowned economist, were to classify the state of the economy or some parts of the state of the economy as 'dismal ' Disappointing, perhaps, 'yes', it could be better, 'yes', but dismal,, if Dr Manmohan singh would permit me to say with respect, it is a disheartening description of what is not 'Dismal' coveys a message as if things are really, totally out of control

(The Deputy Chairman in the Chair)

DR MANMOHAN SINGH Madam, I used the word 'dismal' to describe the power generation situation I don't think there is anybody in this House who would agree that a three per cent annual increase in the power generation, which has been seen in this country for the last three years is anything but dismal

SHRI JASWANT SINGH No, Madam, we would not disagree with that It is not satisfactory, of course But, so far as the detailed aspects are concerned if it is growth rate, 'yes', of course, growth rate has to be sustained We are still unable to, as a country, be confident about the sustainability of what we are achieving as growth rate It is not just sustainability, but continuing to build upon it, layer by layer, so that it becomes sustainability, continuity, and reliability And these are factors that, in fact, result in both nationally and internationally accruing to India a status in the global community How do we do it? May I submit, Madam, that I am obliged by an Act that the Parliament so kindly has itself made and to share with the House, when I present the Budget, three additional documents, the mid-term fiscal policy statement, the fiscal policy strategy statement and the macro-economic framework statement Now, these are the statements that will, in detail, and as explicitly and candidly, of course, as is possible, depict the roadmap of where and how we are attempting to move there

It is true, Madam, investment as I would want is not taking place we took some measures The investment has not taken place, though I do believe as the current manager of the nation's economy that the savings rate that we have should be better, 'yes' But what savings rate that we have currently can sustain the investment that is currently taking place Both are not satisfactory, both should be better, 'yes' And of these two, I am more particularly concerned about the investment lag, and we are attempting in the Finance Ministry to address it as best as one can There was mention also of the Foreign Direct Investment, and, how the Foreign Direct Investment has not really come forward This is an issue that really is of concern to all of us I think the Foreign Direct Investment is not a question of hundred million, 300 million, 200 million coming in driblets by small investors It is the large investment that we have sought And the large investments have really been thwarted, because of larger investment opportunities of power, power generation, some of the major infrastructure items, they have got stymied I do believe that they have got stymied amongst other factors, principally, on account of what Dr Bimal Jalan has put his finger on, we have often in the House observed upon, I have expressed my anguish about it The whole mechanism of decision-making is so turgid It is so time-consuming that it really serves nobody's purpose and it, definitely, does not serve the country's purpose

The policy formulation has moved far ahead The political executives' will, to get the country moving since, say from 1980, has moved far ahead, but the bureaucracy has not kept pace with the movement or the speed with which the policy is moving This mismatch is, perhaps, the principal cause which stymies, retorts, or inhibits, investments even internally as also externally A number of other things have been said but as regards the revenue deficit, tax GDP ratio, you know, Sir, the Finance Minister of this country works with the hand-cuffs It is true I have a limited tax space You spoke of the tax GDP ratio of 9 per cent I feel embarrassed when I compare and see that Brazil, Argentina and countries like that have tax GDP ratio of 18, 20 per cent If a nation like India has a tax GDP ratio of less than 9 per cent, where the direct tax paying community of the country is a miniscular fraction of the 100+million citizens that we are, how are we going to achieve the kind of revenue that we need to meet all the very worthy objectives of reducing the fiscal deficit and approaching the zero revenue deficit target? It is so self-evident How can any country continuously spend more than what it earns? So, zero revenue deficit is an absolute must We, in the Finance Ministry are moving in that direction When I prepare the Budget, I will come and share with you how, and I, candidly, say, Sir, that I have, sitting in front of me, on the benches of the principal Opposition Party, Dr Manmohan Singh and Pranabbabu Both of them had been the Deputy Chairman of the Planning Commission Sir, please forgive me, what we now call Gross Budgetary Support has, actually, become, Gross Borrowing Support And, the annual amount that we are allocating through the Planning Commission, 70 or 80 per cent of it is borrowed and 70-80 per cent of it goes to meet revenue expenditure You make a law Let the Parliament make a law that borrowing shall only be for capital expenditure and not for revenue expenditure If it has been added, it can be added on to the FRBM How can any nation borrow to meet the daily expenditure, which is the revenue expenditure? Sir, it is self-evident I do not want to go into all the details Pranabbabu said how to utilise $ 100 billion reserves, Sir, It will continue to grow, I know it It is a movement towards growth On how best to utilise it, we are already addressing ourselves We can have a discussion in this regard, during the Budget discussion or elsewhere Then, sir, regarding correctives to reforms, I share with you that there is no second-generation and third-generation reforms Isn't it as if a new challenge has been born? Reform is a continuous process It

is a seamless movement from one to another And there have to be correctives because we learn as we go wrong on what is right, what is wrong in the reform process On hot money, principally, and the Statement that was issued about the $ 100 billion, the former Governor, the present Governor and others were all very conscious of the whole question, firstly of arbitrage and secondly of money that is flowing in, only the take advantage of a strong rupee and low interest rates and a good stock exchange, and to flow out it again There is an analysis that the Reserve Bank of India has often done I am requesting the Reserve Bank of India to put out a detailed statement as to how the apprehension about hot money is not there The statement that was issued, the aspect that this is not a factor of arbitrage has also been taken care of

माननीय, मोटे रूप से इसमें सभी मसायल आ गए। About electricity, yes Sir, I would say that power production is very poor, very unsatisfactory, We have taken a number of measures The cumulative effect of all that is still not resulting in the kind of power production that we need But, in purely statistical term, if I were to submit, I would say that the off-take of power in the current phase has been lesser than last year only because the monsoon has been more beneficial and so irrigation requirements are low would not be correct On the question of refining output, again, as a matter of detail, the growth decline is partly, not principally, to be explained by switch from gasoline to CNG We are taking strides in the reform and modernisation of airports, the seaports, roads, and also steel industry has seen a revival Sir, as far as the accelerated growth aspect is concerned, may I be permitted to say that when we come to have a fuller discussion on it, then, we will share it because then the full data will be available, and it will be much more meaningful then

इसके अलावा, माननीय, लालू प्रसाद यादव जी ने जब कहा, था नहीं, लेकिन मैं उनको पुन: आश्वासन दिला दूं कि विन मंत्रालय द्वारा बिहार के प्रति कोई किसी प्रकार का भेदभाव नहीं है। आप आश्वस्त रहिए। हमारे मन में न तो कोई भेदभाव है और न ही व्यवहार में कोई भेदभाव है। अगर कोई कमी-बेशी रह गई है, कोई किसी स्कीम में बिहार का जो पैसा पहुंचना था वह नहीं पहुंचा है उसके बारे में अगर बिहार सरकार मुझे अवगत कराती है तो आप आश्वस्त रहिए, हम उसको लेकर कागजों में इधर-उधर करने में नहीं बैठे हैं।

श्री लालू प्रसाद: महोदया, वित्त मंत्री जी का हम लोग आदर करते हैं। बिहार के लोग, देश भर में लोग आपका आदर करते हैं आपसे व्यक्तिगत रूप से शिकायत नहीं, लेकिन बिहार का बंटवारा हो गया, जो हमारी आमदनी थी वह झारखंड में चली गई। सभी दलों के लोगों ने असेम्बली में प्रस्ताव दिया कि हमको 1,87,000 करोड़ रुपया दीजिए, फिर हमने रिवाइज कर दिया कि 40,000 करोड़ रुपया दीजिए इधर प्रधान मंत्री जी ने बिल्कुल उलट दिया बातों को। भारत सरकार से मेरी शिकायत है, जिसमें आप भी मंत्री हैं तो आप भी थोड़ा सा इसमें आ जाते हैं उस परिव्यू में, पैकेज के नाम पर जो अन्य राज्यों को भी मिलता है, वह सब विकास योजनाएं, प्रधान मंत्री सड़क योजना वगैरह उनको भी आपने गिना दिया, जिससे बिहार के लोगों में काफी नाराजगी है।

दूसरा, महोदया, आपसे हमने अपेक्षा की थी कि बिहार के ऊपर जो कर्जा है, पूंजी की बात नहीं, पूंजी आप ले लीजिए, मगर इंटरेस्ट को आप माफ कर दें। चूंकि हमारा प्रदेश बंट गया, आप लोगों ने वायदा किया था, मैं नहीं चाहता था, मगर बंट गया, तो जैसे हिली स्टेट्स को, ऐसे अन्य राज्यों को, नार्थ-ईस्ट को आपने कहा है कि इंडस्ट्रीज को बढ़ावा देने के लिए वहां इन्कम टैक्स और एक्साइज ड्यूटी को माफ करते हैं, छिफर करते हैं, इसी तरह इधर इंटरेस्ट माफ कर दें। अगर सूद लेना है तो हमको बीस साल की इंस्टालमैंट बांध दीजिए, चूंकि आरसीएफ हमारे यहां है।

महोदया, ये दो-तीन बातें हम लोगों की, पूरे बिहार की हैं। आपने कहा कि ट्रांसपेरेन्सी है, भेदभाव नहीं है। भेदभाव की बात नहीं है, आप व्यक्तिगत् रूप से नहीं, लेकिन जो बिहार से मंत्री हैं और वे बिहार को टारगेट करके नहीं चाहते कि बिहार को कोई मदद हो और उल्टे हिसाब-किताब करते रहते हैं। इस पर कृपा करके आप कुछ कहते तो बिहार के लोगों के बीच में जाकर मैं बताता और आपको माला पहना कर घुमाता।

श्री जसवंत सिंह: आपका बड़प्पन है कि आप हमको माला पहनाएं, लेकिन हमको माला नहीं पहननी, फिर भी आपको आश्वस्त कर दूं कि एक तो बिहार का विभाजन हुआ-बिहार और झारखंड अलग हुए, निश्चित रूप से इस विभाजन के परिणामस्वरूप जो आर्थिक लेन-देन, अदला-बदली करनी है, उसको जल्दी करना है, परन्तु उसमें कई विभाग आते हैं, कई मंत्रालय आ जाते हैं, प्लानिंग कमीशन भी आता है। हम इसमें आपको आश्वस्त करना चाहेंगे कि हम इसको जल्दी कराएंगे, जल्दी से जल्दी, यह न्यायसंगत बात है।

दूसरे, बिहार का जो ऋण है, उसके बारे में मैं आपको निवेदन करुंगा कि आप महीना, डेढ़ महीना ठहर जाइए, हम कोई समुचित व्यवस्था करने के बारे में विचार कर रहे हैं। उसकी सब डिटेल बन जाए, उसमें बिहार के और अन्य राज्यों के ऋण के बारे में भी हम विचार कर रहे हैं।

बाकी तीसरी बात, सड़क या इनको लेकर कोई उपेक्षा हुई है, इस बारे में मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि जो मंत्रालय विशेष है (व्यवधान)

श्री लालू प्रसाद: इंडस्ट्री के लिए एक्साइज और इन्कम टैक्स की छूट के बारे में?

श्री जसवत सिंह: इन्कम टैक्स के बारे में हम अभी तक कोई घोषणा कर ही नहीं सकते। हम इतना ही कह सकते हैं हम देखेंगे कि आपको क्या सुविधा मिल सकती है, इस रूप से ताकि बिहार की प्रगति हो।

श्री लालू प्रसाद: इंडस्ट्री के लिए?

श्री जसवत सिंह: इसके अलावा श्री नीलोत्पल बसु जी ने (व्यवधान)

श्री लालू प्रसाद: सर, पैकेज की आपसे शिकायत नहीं है। भारत सरकार ने, प्रधानमंत्री ने पैकेज नहीं दिया, भेदभाव किया और इसके लिए हम आपको व्यक्तिगत रूप से दोषी नहीं मानते। मैं और मेरा दल, हम वाक-आउट कर रहे हैं। हम भारत सरकार की नीति का पुरजोर विरोध करते हुए वाक-आउट करते हैं।

(तत्पश्चात कुछ माननीय सदस्य सदन से उठकर बाहर चले गए)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH So, I would again, very briefly cover the supplementary demand There is, in fact, incontrovertible evidence that there has been a decline in poverty, and there is an increase in the per capita income

Now, hon Shri Nilotpal Basu had put a question as to why there is a decline in the intake of food grains There is a fury that there is diversification of food habit that has taken place even in the 'below poverty line' section, and what was simply earlier inter-dependence only on food grains I can say this because I have first-hand experience of this in rural Bengal And I certainly have sufficient knowledge of rural Rajasthan, and in greater detail about rural West Rajasthan There is certainly a diversification that has taken place in the eating habits and there is a much greater amount of food and vegetables that has not become part of the intake, even in the desert, which was inconceivable of This transformation is something that I have seen in front of my own eyes It is possible that it is because of this account that statistically when you compute food grains you arrive at a conclusion that the per capita intake of food grains has declined But the conclusion drawn from there that

therefore, the poor are able to lift food grains would not be a correct conclusion We have, afterall, in the current year's Budget, a scheme, the Anna Antyodaya scheme, which gives direct food assistance to one crore and fifty lakh people below the poverty line, to be selected from the poorest of the poor in the village itself Therefore, that conclusion is wrong

One final point-- Shri Pranab Mukherjee said that the supplementaries that we have brought about are really for revenue In a sense, Shri Pranab Mukherjee is right May I submit to him, however, that there are five items Rs 2300 crores out of those five have been paid as compensation to BSNL because operational losses of diversification of rural telephony You can well say that rural telephony is not capital Strictly speaking, may be not, but in another sense, it is a kind of capital expenditure, because it is a part of the infrastructure development

The next two items, 2 and 3, are *Sampoorna Gramin Rozgar Yogana* and then there is *Sarva Siksha Abhiyaan*, which is for additional support to elementary education and that is for employement About Rs 1580 crore is for employment and Rs 550 crore is for *Sarva Siksha Abhiyaan* Then there is Delhi Metro for which Rs 187 crore have been given And Rs 60 crore have gone for meeting the additional requirments of security for the Parliament House These are the five supplementaries I have endeavoured, as far as I can, to answer the broader questions raised by the hon Members I am very grateful for the views that hon Members have shared with me May I commend to the House now, for their consideration, the Appropriation Bill and its return to the Lok Sabha

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Now, the question is

That the Bill to authorise payment and appropriation of certain further sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of the financial year 2003-2004, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration

The motion was adopted

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Now, we shall take up Clause-by-Clause consideration of the Bill

Clauses 2,3 and the Schedule were added to the Bill

Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Title were added to the Bill

SHRI JASWANT SINGH Madam, I beg to move

That the Bill be returned

The question was put and the motion was adopted

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Shri Jaswant Singhji, you have some problem

SHRI JASWANT SINGH I have a request to make, Madam As I have submitted a little earlier, I am perfectly willing to have this discussion on the stamp paper issue. But, as I submitted, I had many months back actually given this commitment for the Annual Lecture to the meeting of the Officers of the Intelligence Bureau If the House would be so considerate as to postpone this discussion for tomorrow I will be grateful

SHRI SATISH PRADHAN (Maharashtra) Tomorrow is the last day of the House, so the discussion must take place today

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN What I am suggesting is that we can start the discussion and your Minister will take the notes You can reply whenever it is convenient to you

SHRI JASWANT SINGH If the hon Members do not consider it an act of any kind of impropriety on my part or if they permit me to be absent, then certainly the discussion can go on, notes will still be taken If you permit, I will reply tomorrow

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN If it is convenient, today or tomorrow The House so agrees We start the discussion

---

MESSAGES FROM LOK SABHA

(i) The Merchant Shipping (Amendment) Bill, 2003

(ii) The Indian Medicine Central Council (Amendment) Bill, 2003